



This is a digital copy of a book that was preserved for generations on library shelves before it was carefully scanned by Google as part of a project to make the world's books discoverable online.

It has survived long enough for the copyright to expire and the book to enter the public domain. A public domain book is one that was never subject to copyright or whose legal copyright term has expired. Whether a book is in the public domain may vary country to country. Public domain books are our gateways to the past, representing a wealth of history, culture and knowledge that's often difficult to discover.

Marks, notations and other marginalia present in the original volume will appear in this file - a reminder of this book's long journey from the publisher to a library and finally to you.

Usage guidelines

Google is proud to partner with libraries to digitize public domain materials and make them widely accessible. Public domain books belong to the public and we are merely their custodians. Nevertheless, this work is expensive, so in order to keep providing this resource, we have taken steps to prevent abuse by commercial parties, including placing technical restrictions on automated querying.

We also ask that you:

- + *Make non-commercial use of the files* We designed Google Book Search for use by individuals, and we request that you use these files for personal, non-commercial purposes.
- + *Refrain from automated querying* Do not send automated queries of any sort to Google's system: If you are conducting research on machine translation, optical character recognition or other areas where access to a large amount of text is helpful, please contact us. We encourage the use of public domain materials for these purposes and may be able to help.
- + *Maintain attribution* The Google "watermark" you see on each file is essential for informing people about this project and helping them find additional materials through Google Book Search. Please do not remove it.
- + *Keep it legal* Whatever your use, remember that you are responsible for ensuring that what you are doing is legal. Do not assume that just because we believe a book is in the public domain for users in the United States, that the work is also in the public domain for users in other countries. Whether a book is still in copyright varies from country to country, and we can't offer guidance on whether any specific use of any specific book is allowed. Please do not assume that a book's appearance in Google Book Search means it can be used in any manner anywhere in the world. Copyright infringement liability can be quite severe.

About Google Book Search

Google's mission is to organize the world's information and to make it universally accessible and useful. Google Book Search helps readers discover the world's books while helping authors and publishers reach new audiences. You can search through the full text of this book on the web at <http://books.google.com/>

Columbia University
Contributions to Education
Teachers College Series



.7231



LELAND STANFORD JUNIOR UNIVERSITY



SCHOOL OF EDUCATION
LIBRARY

**THE SOCIAL FACTORS AFFECTING
SPECIAL SUPERVISION IN THE
PUBLIC SCHOOLS OF THE
UNITED STATES**

BY

WALTER ALBERT JESSUP, Ph.D.

**PROFESSOR OF EDUCATION, INDIANA UNIVERSITY
SOMETIME FELLOW IN EDUCATION,
TEACHERS COLLEGE, COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY**

**TEACHERS COLLEGE, COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
CONTRIBUTIONS TO EDUCATION, NO. 43**

PUBLISHED BY

**Teachers College, Columbia University
NEW YORK CITY**

1911

Copyright 1911, by Walter Albert Jessup

113703

C

PREFACE

This study was undertaken in connection with a course in Educational Sociology under Professor Henry Suzzallo, and to him I owe my greatest debt of gratitude for continuous encouragement and helpful criticism.

Grateful acknowledgment is also due to Professors Thorndike, Strayer and Monroe for assistance rendered, and to the hundreds of school superintendents and supervisors throughout the United States, who responded so promptly to the requests for data.

I am also deeply indebted to my friend, Dr. Lotus Delta Coffman, for many helpful suggestions and much sympathetic counsel, and to my wife for constant inspiration and untiring effort in tabulating data and revising the manuscript.

WALTER ALBERT JESSUP

Bloomington, Indiana
April, 1911

CONTENTS

Chapter		PAGE
I.	INTRODUCTION	I
	Statement of problem.—Method.	
II.	MUSIC	4
	Attitude of Early Puritans.—Attempts at improvement.—Agitation for singing school.—Development of choir.—Reaction against choir.—Growth in popular interest in music.—Music as a Common School subject.—Boston Academy of Music.—Results.—Sanction.—Actual introduction in Boston.—Influence of the Academy of Music.—Lack of permanent success.—Agitation elsewhere.—Religious pressure.—Attitude within the school.—Statement of a leader in Public School music.—Intellectual value dominant.—Formal discipline.—Administrative means used.—Summary.	
III.	DRAWING	18
	Early indifference.—Scattering attempts at drawing instruction.—Insufficient pressure to insure persistent attention.—Economic value of drawing.—English influence.—Meagre results.—Divergent points of view.—Effects of Paris Exhibit of 1867.—Result of petition.—Transfer of English leader.—Industrial nature of drawing.—Attempts elsewhere.—Impetus given by Centennial Exposition.—Varying conceptions.—Reception within the school.—Neglect on part of regular teachers.—Difficulty in sticking to industrial purpose.—Intellectual value uppermost.—Mental discipline in drawing.—Plan in administration.—Summary.	
IV.	MANUAL TRAINING	32
	Social and economic changes.—Relation of manual training to drawing.—Centennial Exposition.—Beginnings of Technical Education.—Secondary manual training schools supported by economic forces.—Humanitarian activities.—Practical nature of instruction in charity schools.—Kitchen Garden movement.—Industrial Education Association.—Pressure for manual training in New York City.—Introduction in New York schools.—Training schools for teachers.—Spread of influence.—Private instruction in Boston.—Boston school committee assumes responsibility.—Forces outside of school back of manual training movement.—Opposition of teachers.—Relation of kindergarten movement to manual training movement.—Attitude of Felix Adler.—Attitude of Nicholas Murray Butler.—Estimate by Commissioner Dawson.—Manual training interpreted in the light of intellectual tradition of school.—Attitude of Charles W. Eliot and others.—Refraction of outside pressure within the school.—Administration.—Summary.	

	PAGE
V. DOMESTIC SCIENCE	51
Decline of Home Industries.—New opportunities for women outside the home.—Early attempt to meet the situation.—Early sanction.—Relation of sewing to industrial art drawing.—Private support in Boston.—Relation of sewing to manual training.—Spread of influence.—Private initiative in cooking schools of Boston.—Private initiative in cooking schools of Philadelphia.—Modification after fusion with manual training movement.—Attitude of the school toward domestic science.—Intellectual value emphasized.—Sewing and cooking less refracted by school room traditions than manual training.—Administration.—Summary.	
VI. PHYSICAL EDUCATION	64
Early attitude.—Exercise through work.—Jefferson's military ideal.—Military academies.—German gymnastics.—Fellenberg movement.—Physiology and hygiene.—Demand for school exercise.—Dio Lewis as a leader.—Spread of the Lewis system.—Decline of interest.—Rise of German influence.—Results of the activity of Turners.—Cincinnati as a type.—Other organizations contributed.—Private initiative in Boston.—Union of forces produced wave of enthusiasm.—Reception within the school.—Physical exercise in place of the recess period.—Physical exercise as a training of the will.—Refraction of demand within the school.—Administration.—Summary.	
VII. PENMANSHIP	78
Early religious sanction for reading and writing schools.—Writing less important than reading.—Traditional means of instruction in writing.—Commercial sanction.—Double-headed system of instruction.—Pressure brought to bear on regular teachers.—Decline of writing schools.—Attitude of school.—Administration.—Summary.	
VIII. DISTRIBUTION OF SPECIALISTS.....	86
Spread of the practice of employing supervisors.—Method of distribution.—Sources of information.—Limitations.—Table 1, Distribution of specialists for music, drawing, penmanship in 1875.—Table 2, same for 1885.—Table 3, same for 1908.—Table 4, Distribution of specialists of manual training, domestic science and sewing, 1893.—Table 5, same for 1908.—Table 6, Distribution of specialists in physical education, 1893.—Table 7, same for 1908.—Table 8, Summary.	
IX. SALARIES	97
Sources of information.—Method of tabulation.—Table 9, Distribution of salaries of specialists of music.—Table 10, same for drawing.—Table 11, same for penmanship.—Table 12, same for manual training.—Table 13, same for domestic science and sewing.—Table 14, same for physical education.—Table 15, Summary.	
X. SEX SELECTION	106
Source of information and method of treatment.—Table 16, (a) Distribution of men and women by subjects and location.—(b) Percentage of women specialists distributed by subjects and location.	

Contents

vii

	PAGE
XI. DIVISION OF RESPONSIBILITY.....	108
Source of information.—Table 17, (1) Showing difference in division of responsibility.—(2) Combining irrespective of size of city.—(3) Percentage of cities following plan C.—Discussion.—Summary.	
XII. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION.....	112
Sanctions.—Origin of demand.—Typical ways in which new subject matter became part of the curriculum.—Refraction within schoolrooms.—Spread of the practice.—Salaries.—Sex.—Division of Responsibility.	
APPENDIX	
I. INFORMATION CARD	118
II. TABULATION SHEET	119
III. BIBLIOGRAPHY	120

THE SOCIAL FACTORS AFFECTING SPECIAL SUPERVISION

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

The increase in the number of subjects for instruction in the public school curriculum within recent years has been marked. Many of these subjects have been introduced into the schools by means of special teachers or supervisors. The administrative adjustment to this situation has been accompanied by no little difficulty. Special teachers and supervisors have multiplied until it is no uncommon thing to find a single city employing such specialists in a half dozen subjects, including music, drawing, physical education, manual training, domestic science and penmanship.

This involves not only an enormous expenditure of money but other complications arise in the matter of the adjustment of the time schedules for inspection and instruction and in the division of responsibility for instruction in these various subjects. Indeed the whole problem of the administration of these so-called special subjects is by no means the least difficult of the tasks which fall to the lot of the school superintendent.

Statement of Problem

It is with appreciation of the importance of the problem that the present study has been undertaken. This study does not include all or any considerable number of the phases of the subject; rather it is an attempt to clear the ground and to provide data for a continued investigation which might safely lead to constructive conclusions relative to administrative policy. It has seemed wise to confine the investigation within the following limits: (a) to find sanctions back of the demand for the introduction of these subjects most commonly thought of in con-

nection with special teaching or supervision, namely, music, drawing, manual training, domestic science, physical education, sewing and penmanship; (b) to ascertain if possible whether the demand for these subjects came from within the school itself or whether it came from the school group outside; (c) to point out certain typical ways in which the new subject matter became a part of the curriculum; (d) to determine the effect of the traditions of the school on the interpretation of the new subject matter; (e) to determine certain quantitative aspects of the problem including the distribution of specialists, for subject, location, salary, sex and method.

Method

With these problems thus stated it can be seen that this study can not be confined to the single field of statistical inquiry; rather there is needed enough of history to furnish a genetic view and enough of the quantitative treatment to indicate the present situation and tendency, plus such critical interpretation as the facts seem to warrant. Owing to the social nature of these problems the expressed opinions of the leaders in the various movements have peculiar value in throwing light on the forces that were operative in bringing about the introduction of these subjects. For as Commissioner Brown says, "The man who inaugurates a new movement in human history is one who gives expression to what many have been thinking more or less clearly."¹

As a consequence of this demand for knowledge of the opinion of leaders, it has been necessary to direct especial attention to the words of these leaders in connection with the various organizations of school people, as the American Institute of Instruction and the National Education Association. Likewise the reports of the leaders to their local boards and to the United States Commissioner of Education, have been significant in revealing attitudes toward the subjects under discussion.

Commissioner Brown has called attention to the universal prominence of Massachusetts in the matter of educational leadership thus, "whenever an illustration of some good educational movement is needed, Massachusetts appears with a conspicuous

¹ Making of Our Middle Schools, 9.

example. At almost every call her hand goes up among the first."²

The rapidity with which the North Atlantic and the North Central States have adopted the custom of employing special teachers and supervisors indicates their leadership in this particular,³ and is a justification for the apparent predominance of attention to certain centers of influence within this group.

² *Ibid.*, viii.

³ See Tables I to VIII.

CHAPTER II

MUSIC

Attitude of Early Puritans toward Music

Although music is an "old" subject in the history of education, its introduction into the public school curriculum came relatively late. When the reading and writing schools and the grammar schools were being established in the colonial period, music was the subject of a bitter controversy. This was most apparent in the New England section where religious feeling was such a strong factor in shaping the institutions. The continuous and far reaching influence of this section on the educational affairs of the country warrants a clear study of this situation.

When the Puritans revolted they included music in its existing forms in the list of things to be rejected: "They destroyed organs, music books, dissolved church choirs and chased musicians from the church gallery."¹

Attempts at Improvement

It was with difficulty that the clergy was able to convince our New England forefathers that singing in any form was other than sinful. Even granting that there might be a Scriptural sanction for psalm singing there remained other questions for grave dispute; for example, the wisdom of allowing Christians only to sing, the assembly joining in the silence and responding Amen. Meanwhile the skill in singing steadily declined until sensitive ears were shocked beyond endurance. Rev. Thomas Symmes of Bradford, Massachusetts, wrote in 1720, "It is with great difficulty that this part of the worship is performed, and with great indecency in some congregations for want of skill; it is to be feared singing must be wholly omitted in some places for want of skill, if this art is not revived.

¹ Quoted from Ritter, *Music in America*, 4.

The rules of singing not being taught or learnt, everyone sang as best pleased himself, and every leading singer would take the liberty to raise any note of the tune or lower it as best pleased his ear; and add such turns and flourishes as were grateful to him; and this was done so gradually that few, if any, took notice of it.”²

In the latter part of the seventeenth and the beginning of the eighteenth century the knowledge of tunes was so limited that it was an exception to find a congregation able to sing more than three or four tunes. The leading clergymen, including Mather, Edwards, Dwight, Symmes, Wise, Eliot, Walter, and Stoddard were aggressive in their effort to bring about an improvement. However, this was strongly opposed by the congregation. In 1723, a number of these ministers united in the preparation of a tract called “Cases of Conscience about singing Psalms briefly considered and resolved.” In this they set forth a number of questions that had been disturbing the peace of the communities. The following is suggestive of their treatment: “Is it possible for Fathers forty years old and upwards to learn to sing by rule? And ought they attempt at that age to learn? . . . Whether they who purposely sing a tune different from that which is appointed by the pastor, or elder to be sung, are not guilty of acting disorderly, and taking God’s name in vain also, by disturbing the order of the sanctuary.”³

Agitation for Singing School

The following quotation from the tract of Rev. Thomas Symmes written the same year throws additional light on the situation: “I have used my best endeavours, according to the measure God has given me, to prevent the rise and afterwards the progress of such an unhappy controversy in this place, yet there has been a great deal of contention and uneasiness amongst us, about the Singing by rule and I perceive there are some yet dissatisfied. Now it being my purpose to encourage singing meetings in the town in the long Winter evenings,—and thot it prudence to make another essay introductory to my setting

² Hood, *History of Music in New England*, 88.

³ Quoted from Hood, *History of Music in New England*, 87. See also Elson, *National Music in America*, 49.

forward such a laudable practice that it might then be possible to ease the minds of all amongst us that remain dissatisfied on this score. . . . As to getting money by it—why the singing-master is not worthy of his reward for his pains in teaching our children to sing, as well as the school dame or schoolmaster, for teaching our children to read, write and cypher, I cannot devise. For musick is as real and as lawful and ingenious an art as either of the other. I don't say as useful and necessary."⁴

Reference has already been made to the attempt to start singing schools in order that the desired knowledge and skill might be attained. Concerning this Rev. Symmes in a letter written 1723 said: "Would it not greatly tend to promote singing of psalms if singing schools were promoted? Would we not thus be conforming to scripture pattern? Have we not as much need for these as God's people of old? Have we any reason to expect to be inspired with the gift of singing, any more than that of reading? . . . Where would be the difficulty or what the disadvantages if people who want skill in singing, would procure skillful persons to instruct them, and meet two or three evenings in the week from five or six o'clock to eight and spend the time learning to sing. Would it not be proper for school masters in country parishes to teach their scholars? Are they not very unwise who plead against learning to sing by rule, when they can't learn to sing at all unless they learn by rule? Has not the grand enemy of Souls a hand in this who prejudices them against the best means of singing?"⁵

The opposition gave way in the presence of such persistent onslaughts of the clergy. With the spread of the new practice in singing by rule the singing-school became a necessity. Concerning this Mr. John Curriren says: "The controversy which ended in the introduction of new tunes developed the necessity of the singing school. On the ruins of the old Psalmody the singing school took its rise and from this time New England Psalmody began to advance. Singing schools which began about 1720 became quite common from Maine to Georgia at the beginning of the seventeenth century."⁶

⁴ Quoted from Ritter, *Music in America*, 15.

⁵ *Ibid.*, 28.

⁶ Quoted from *Worship Music*, 117.

Development of Choir

With this increase in technique and necessity for highly specialized knowledge music gradually became the special responsibility of those persons who were familiar with the new ways. Those who had attended the singing school together tended to sit together in the church service and thus the choir developed. From the "History of Rowley" we read—1752—"the parish voted that those who had learned the art of singing may have liberty to sit in the front gallery."⁷

Further evidence of this is shown in the following paragraph from the "History of Worcester": "The final blow was struck to the old system by the resolution of the town, August 5, 1779, 'Voted that the singers sit in the front seats of the front gallery and that those gentlemen who have hitherto sat in the front seats of said gallery have a right to sit in the front and second seat below, and that said singers have said seats appointed to said use. Voted, that said singers be requested to take said seats; and carry on the singing in the public worship.'"⁸

Reaction against Choir

With the division of responsibility and the rise of specialists came a clash in standards of musical excellence. The artistic taste of the choristers developed on lines more or less out of harmony with the spirit of worship.

With the increased technique came increased vanity. "Flashy anthems, boisterous fuguing choruses, and long spun out solos" became the fashion among the choirs. "The church singer, whom the musical clergyman had preached into existence, began to feel his great importance as an integrant part of the church service; and scarcely had he conquered his envied place, when the clergyman found himself obliged to preach him down again."⁹

Growth in Popular Interest in Music

By the opening of the nineteenth century popular interest developed in music as an art to such an extent that music

⁷ Quoted from Ritter, *Music in America*, 48.

⁸ *Ibid.*, 48.

⁹ *Ibid.*, 49.

societies sprang up quite generally. The most notable of these were the Stoughton Musical Society, established in 1786, the Boston Handel and Haydn Society, organized in 1815, and the New York Choral Society in 1823.¹⁰

Music as a Common School Subject

With this increase of interest in singing and the growing importance of the Public Schools, it is not surprising to find that definite efforts were being made to include singing instruction as a part of the work of the schools. In 1830 Wm. C. Woodbridge delivered a lecture on Vocal Music as a branch of Common Education before the American Institute of Instruction, which attracted much attention. Woodbridge, who had recently returned from a trip abroad, was much impressed with the singing in Germany and Switzerland. "It was with no small degree of surprise and delight that we found it (music) in Germany and in Switzerland the *property of the people*, cheering their hours of labor, elevating their hearts above the objects of sense, which are so prone to absorb them, and filling the periods of rest and amusement with social and moral song in place of noise, riot and gambling. But we were touched to the hearts when we heard its cheering, animating strains echoing from the walls of a school room."¹¹

Lowell Mason, an enthusiastic leader in musical affairs at the time, also had a vision of the value to be attained through the widespread diffusion of instruction in singing. He was especially interested in church music; indeed he has been called by some the "Father of Church Music in America." He adopted the methods of Pestalozzi through the influence of Woodbridge and was most influential in arousing interest in the problem of popular musical instruction.

Boston Academy of Music

In 1833 the Boston Academy of Music was organized with Lowell Mason at the head. The purpose of this organization can be seen from the following statement of their plans: "First,

¹⁰ See Elson, *National Music in America*, 275.

¹¹ Report of Proceedings of American Institute of Instruction, 1830.

To establish schools of music for juvenile classes; Second, To establish singing schools for adult classes; Third, To form a class of instruction in the methods of teaching music which may be composed of teachers, parents, and all other persons desirous to qualify themselves for teaching vocal music; Fourth, To form an association of choristers for purposes of improvement in conducting and performing social music in the church; Fifth, To establish a course of scientific lectures for teachers, choristers, and others; Sixth, To establish a course of popular lectures on the nature and object of church music and style of composition and execution appropriate to it, with experimental illustrations by the performances of a select choir; Seventh, To establish exhibitions and concerts of, (1), juvenile classes, (2), select performers, (3), large numbers collected annually or semi-annually; Eighth, To introduce vocal music into the Public Schools, by the aid of such teachers as the Academy may be able to employ, each of whom shall instruct classes, alternately in a number of schools; Ninth, To publish circulars and essays for the purpose of the Academy."¹²

Results

An analysis of the plans of the organization reveals the secret of its wonderful influence. The appeal is made in the name of the religious sanction; instruction is to cut through the various social levels and reach teachers, children, parents and choristers. Publicity is to be gained not only through the usual channels, but by means of attractive exhibitions. With such a well organized plan it is not surprising to find that the movement was successful. From the first the organization met with support. The second annual report showed that over twenty-two hundred pupils had been enrolled. Sporadic attempts were made from time to time to get the school committee to undertake the burden of music instruction. Little came of it, however, until 1836, when the Academy of Music succeeded in getting the Select School Committee of Boston to adopt a memorial in favor of Music.

¹² Quoted from the *American History and Encyclopedia of Music*, volume on American Music, 19-20.

Sanctions

In this report the arguments for and against music were set forth somewhat fully. The arguments for it were based on its value as an aid to reading, its value as a means of relaxation and its significance as an aid to the spirit of devotion. Its relation to other accomplishments was recognized thus: "It is objected that if one accomplishment is introduced into our schools, why not another? If instruction is given in vocal music, why should it not be given in dancing also? The answer simply is, because music is not dancing; because music has an intellectual character, which dancing has not; and above all because music has its moral purpose, which dancing has not."¹³

The following resolution, dated August 24, 1837, marks the next step taken by the Board: "This Committee, August 24, 1837, submitted the following resolution to the Board:

- Resolved: That the experiment be tried in four schools.
- Resolved: That the experiment be given in charge of the Boston Academy of Music, under the direction of the Board.
- Resolved: That the experiment be commenced as soon as possible after the passing of this resolution and be controlled and extended as the Board may hereafter determine.
- Resolved: That these resolutions be transmitted to the city council, and that they be respectfully requested to make such appropriation as may be necessary to carry this plan into effect."¹⁴

Actual Introduction in Boston

The city council, however, refused to appropriate the necessary funds for making the experiment. Whereupon Lowell Mason introduced this instruction in one school on his own initiative, and at his own expense. This was well received and with such success that the opposition was broken down. The year following Mr. Mason was regularly employed as Superintendent of Music for the Boston Schools. He rapidly systematized the work and during his administration the work was successfully carried on. He was aggressive in the matter of giving special training to the teachers in the subject.

¹³ It is interesting to note this in the light of the present agitation in favor of the introduction of dancing in the Public Schools.

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, 251.

Influence of the Academy of Music

The Boston Academy of Music affords an excellent example of the possibilities to be attained through skillful organization, wise leadership and persistent effort, in the matter of registration of a social demand on the curriculum of the schools. Concerning their responsibility in this matter the following contemporaneous estimate is significant: "To the exertion of the Academy of Music undoubtedly we are chiefly indebted for the introduction of music in the public schools. They have taken upon themselves the heavy responsibility of a most important experiment, the success of which must exert the strongest influence on the future destiny of the art amongst us."¹⁵

Frank Damrosch recently said: "The most important service rendered by the Boston Academy of Music was its effort to influence public school authorities to introduce systematic instruction of singing in the public schools."¹⁶

It is not to be inferred that Boston was alone in this matter—rather that the foregoing statement is somewhat typical of the steps taken in the introduction of the subject and the succeeding struggles. Nevertheless, Mr. Lowell Mason's influence, in connection with the Academy of Music, served as a powerful example for imitation. As to the effect of this work elsewhere, the third annual report of the Academy, issued in 1835, says: "Letters have been received from persons in Georgia, South Carolina, Virginia, Illinois, Missouri, Tennessee, Ohio, Maryland, New York, Connecticut, Vermont, New Hampshire, and Maine asking for information relative to measures which they ought to adopt in order to introduce music as a branch of education in the common schools where they live."¹⁷

The fact that this report was made before the final introduction of the subject into the Boston Schools indicates the publicity which accompanied their efforts.

Lack of Permanent Success

However, the success of public school music was by no means continuous, even in Boston, despite the fact that it received

¹⁵ Editorial Statement, *Musical Magazine*, July 6, 1839.

¹⁶ *American History and Encyclopedia of Music*, Music in America, 21.

¹⁷ 3rd Ann. Rept., 1835.

recognition at the hands of the Board. There was sufficient pressure in favor of music instruction to warrant its continued presence in the schools as a subject of study, but this was not strong enough to demand adequate provision for instruction. Concerning this Superintendent Philbrick said: "All along there was more or less opposition to it on the part of those members of the Board who took narrow views of the scope and aims of education; the provision made for teaching it was inadequate, and the standard of attainments arrived at was what we should regard as very low. . . . One music master was annually appointed 'to provide teachers of singing, and superintend the same,' for which service he was allowed a certain compensation for each school taught. . . . After this had been in practice about eight years, it was superseded by a 'double-headed system,' the schools being divided between two music masters, who were allowed to employ their respective assistants. This was undoubtedly a step backward, and in two or three years was followed by a still greater stride in the same direction. . . . The sub-committee of each school was authorized to nominate a teacher of music for the school under the charge of the same. This sporadic arrangement was not a success."¹⁸

Renewed interest was taken in the subject from 1856 on, and in 1864 the office of supervisor and teacher of music in the Primary Schools was created.

Agitation Elsewhere

The records of the city schools of this period show the same general attitude toward the subject. A music teacher was employed in Chicago about 1840 at a salary of sixteen dollars per month. Owing to a lack of funds the position was discontinued. In 1846 the children by popular subscription paid for a special teacher of singing.¹⁹

"In 1848, a musical convention was held in the First Baptist Church in Chicago, in which singers and those interested in music gathered together to discuss the best means of securing the advantage of a general musical education for the young of

¹⁸ Quoted from Boston School Report, 1874, 274.

¹⁹ Clark, Public Schools of Chicago.

the city; the adoption of the study of music in the public schools and the improvement of church singing."²⁰

Music was included in the list of required studies for the High Schools of California in 1851.

Milwaukee, St. Louis, and Cincinnati were also the scenes of early activity in connection with music. Indeed the German population throughout the West was uniformly aggressive in this particular.

In the third quarter of the last century there was a great spread of musical conventions, institutes and normals. Music festivals were organized all over the country. Many of these became relatively stable, and held together a permanent following. All of these activities served the purpose of not only bringing together those who were already interested in singing, but focusing attention in such a way that a popular interest was aroused.

The kindergarten movement contributed not a little to the agitation for the general introduction of music into the schools.

Religious Pressure

The relation between school music and the religious service has at all times been prominent. Other things being equal, public school singing has not advanced so rapidly in communities dominated by religious bodies which were opposed or indifferent to singing in the church. A comparison between a Quaker community in Pennsylvania and a German community in the Middle West, as to their attitude in this matter, reveals this quite clearly.

In a personal interview with a member of a school board, in a city of the Central West, dominated by a German population, the following facts were brought out. A supervisor of music was employed a few years ago who proved very successful in the development of the subject, both in and out of school. Oratorios were rendered, festivals were held, and a large orchestra was maintained. This influence was soon felt in the churches of the city. At length this supervisor was elected to a position elsewhere. When this was made public, the Board

²⁰ Quoted in *American History and Encyclopedia of Music*, volume on American Music, 185.

was made the subject of a perfect onslaught. The *Sunday* schools could not afford to lose this man. The church created such a pressure that the supervisor's salary was raised beyond all precedent.

Attitude within the School

Thus far attention has been directed to certain changes that have taken place relative to music. The change in the religious attitude and the growth in popular interest in singing have been pointed out. A typical example of the means used in securing the introduction of instruction in vocal music in the public schools has been given. The question arises as to the reception given to this demand by the schoolmaster himself. Did he respond in spirit as well as in form? Did he interpret this demand in the light of its origin? A study of the printed statements in the school reports and the papers read at the educational conventions during the years paralleling the widespread introduction of music as a part of the regular curriculum, leads one to the conclusion that the leaders in education were prone to read a meaning of their own into the subject. The traditions of the schoolroom were such that it seemed necessary to look for some occult "educational" value in order to give sanction for its presence in the schoolroom. It was not enough to have singing for its own sake; psychological belief in formal discipline was reflected on every hand.²¹

Statement of a Leader in Public School Music

A department of music instruction was organized in connection with the National Education Association in 1885. At that meeting the President of this section, Mr. Daniel B. Hagar, summarized the value of music thus:

I. Music as a means of Mental Culture.

- (1) Perceptive faculties . . . The teaching of the simplest element in reading gives far less occasion for mental action, than the teaching of a corresponding element in music, and of course the less the action the less the power acquired.
- (2) Next in order after the perceptive comes memory . . . As the relations of music involving all the varieties of rhythm, and melody and dynamics, are exceedingly numerous, the study of music is pre-eminently adapted to the culture of the memory.

²¹ See Proc., N. E. A., 1885 *et seq.*

- (3) In close connection with memory is the faculty of recollection in the training of which music may perform an important part. . . .
- (4) That the study of music tends to cultivate the imagination is obvious, for there is no emotion or passion which cannot gain utterance in music.
- (5) Again, however, the faculty of reason may be defined—and its definitions are numerous—it cannot well be denied that a science which occasions the most vigorous exercise of the understanding affords ample scope for the reason.

II. In the second place, music holds an important relation to schools on account of its moral power. . . . We see how it calms the troubled mind; how it sheds cheerfulness upon daily toil; how it revives the drooping spirits; how it carries the sweetest pleasures into the family circle; how it lifts the soul from the dull plains of earth to the celestial mountains.

III. In the third place, music may justly claim a prominent position in schools by reason of its influence on physical culture. Vocal music enlarges the lungs, expands the chest and gives increased vigor to all its organs. . . . I have not a doubt that the early, systematic and persistent practice of music in our schools would be instrumental in prolonging thousands of lives, and in saving multitudes from that direful disease—consumption.²²

Intellectual Value Dominant

The value suggested in the last paragraph was quite generally accepted during the eighties. Nevertheless, the intellectual value was uppermost in the mind of the schoolmaster. United States Commissioner Dawson said: "A view of the matter not frequently taken, is that of Mr. F. B. Richardson, Superintendent of Schools, Woburn, Massachusetts. He says, 'That there are many advantages to be gained by the study of music is very evident, but it may be fairly questioned whether it is the business of the schools to teach this subject as an art, and measure off the progress of the pupils by the amount of pleasing harmony they can produce at a given time. 'As drawing is taught, not to make a finished draughtsman, but to train the judgment and secure attentive observation, so music should be directed toward training the mind in such a way as to give it more power, not merely in the production of sweet sounds, but in performing the ordinary duties of life. There is no room in the curriculum for musical training; but training in

²² Proc. N. E. A., 1885, 369-75.

music properly directed may be made of great value. If this distinction and the limits of this study are kept clearly in view, the efficiency of your educational system may be increased by devoting an hour a week to this branch; otherwise the time had better be spent on some other phase of mental development.'"²³

In the foregoing statement the fear lest the subject be taught from the art standpoint is quite significant in the light of the long prevailing method of instruction which has placed chief emphasis on the purely formal or mechanical side.

Formal Discipline

As a further illustration of the attitude which the school men assumed toward music the following is suggestive: Mr. W. E. Pulsifer made a report before the music department of the National Education Association in 1892, which attempted to cover the "educational" side of the subject. Mr. Pulsifer reported the answers to a list of questions which had been submitted to a number of the prominent educational leaders of the time. Definite statements were received from over forty of these men in answer to the following questions:

1. Do you consider vocal music, as it should be taught in the schools, a means of stimulating and developing the mental faculties?

2. Which particular faculties of the mind do you think vocal music most directly stimulates?

The returns from this group of men were practically unanimous to the effect that vocal music as it should be taught, would serve to stimulate and to develop the mental faculties. No hesitation was shown in the matter of naming the various faculties to be developed by the proper study of music. These included the faculties of: perception, memory, judgment, discrimination, imagination, hearing, beauty, attention, taste, precision, self-restraint, subordination, accuracy, morals, calculation, concentration, seeing, harmony, love, conscience, reverence, admiration, aesthetics, will, compassion, observation, "the phantasy." One answer is worthy of complete quotation: "I believe no study can claim authority over music in developing mental

²³ Quoted from the Report, Commissioner of Education, 1887, 213.

activity, and if circumstances attending its thorough teaching are perfect, its influence is at once apparent in all other studies, stimulating and lubricating the mental faculties to wonderful attainments."²⁴

Administrative Means Used to Secure Instruction

The prevailing administrative plan for securing instruction in this subject has been to divide the burden of responsibility between special teachers or supervisors and the regular teachers. Only in exceptional instances has the regular teacher been held entirely responsible for instruction in singing.²⁵

No considerable number of the regular teachers are required to show knowledge of music as a requisite to certification. This is in striking contrast to the situation in Germany, where the regular teachers are thoroughly trained in both vocal and instrumental music.²⁶

Summary

With the increased recognition of the value of music as an adjunct to worship came increased attention to the technique involved.

The controversy over method resulted in the widespread adoption of a system of musical notation.

With this came the necessity for singing schools as a means for transmission of the formal symbols. Increased interest in congregational singing and in a general musical culture brought about a demand for popular instruction in singing.

This demand was registered in the public schools by means of organization of outside groups—Boston Academy of Music an example.

Public opinion was for a long time apparently satisfied with the official recognition. The traditions of the school were such that the intellectual value of music was made most prominent.

The burden of responsibility has been placed in charge of special teachers or supervisors, rather than of the regular teachers.

²⁴ Proc. N. E. A., 1892, 519-524. The curious reader is referred to the complete discussion in the published proceedings for a more detailed treatment of this topic including the names of the correspondents.

²⁵ See Chap. XI.

²⁶ Kandel, *The Training of Elementary Teachers in Germany*, 135-168.

CHAPTER III

DRAWING

Early Indifference

A number of causes have contributed to the early indifference in regard to popular instruction in drawing in this country. Among these might be mentioned the fact that the hardships attendant to a pioneer life are not calculated to foster artistic taste or creation. Stern necessity places such a high premium upon utility that art as such is driven into the background. The early public schools centered attention around the bare essentials necessary for practical participation within the group. The few who had an interest in drawing as an art and economic leisure to gratify their taste, were provided for by means of private instruction or in the private schools where it was usually taught as an accomplishment for which an extra charge was made.¹

Indeed there was much downright prejudice against allowing children to "waste" their time on such pursuits. This public displeasure was so great that the early efforts at the introduction of drawing as a part of the public school curriculum met with almost universal failure.

Scattering Attempts at Drawing Instruction

In 1821, Wm. Bentley Fowle, a member of the Boston School Committee, who suddenly came into the position of head master of one of the public schools of that city, provided instruction in drawing. Although the actual work is said to have been successful, the people within a couple of years succeeded not only in eliminating the subject, but also in effecting the discharge of the head master; whereupon Fowle established a private school for girls which met with considerable approval. Here he

¹ Clark, Monograph 14, in Butler, Education in United States. Also, Art and Industry, Part I, XXXV.

was able to select students with a narrower range of taste and practical necessity.²

The early attempt at the introduction of the subject in Philadelphia, Baltimore, Cleveland and elsewhere met with similar opposition.³

In Boston the advocates succeeded in getting the school committee in 1827 to make drawing a permissive study in the upper class. But little came of this, however, because of the lack of teaching facilities. Even after the subject was placed on the required list in 1836, the results were meagre. In order to improve the situation Miss E. P. Peabody did gratuitous service as a teacher of drawing in 1838-9. This was followed by a special course of instruction for teachers. However, the results were only temporarily improved.⁴

Insufficient Pressure to Insure Persistent Attention

The impetus which was given to the work by individual initiative was of value, but there was lacking the social pressure necessary for the promotion of serious and continuous consideration of the subject. Not until several decades later do we find this pressure sufficiently strong to actually bring about a widespread change in the practice in the schoolrooms of Boston. The early drawing enthusiasts lacked a popular sanction.

Economic Value of Drawing

Drawing really made little headway until it was associated with an economic value; with the economic interpretation, emphasis was largely placed on the mechanical side. As early as 1747 Benjamin Franklin saw the economic value of drawing and enumerated it in his proposed course of study for the Academy of the day. He included it with writing and arithmetic as a study of utility.⁵

Popular acceptance of this belief, however, was delayed for over a century. In the matter of creating public sentiment the

² Clarke, Monograph 14, in Butler, Education in United States. Drawing in Public Schools, pp. 4-8.

³ *Ibid.*, 13-34.

⁴ *Ibid.*, 13.

⁵ Proposals Relating to Education, Benjamin Franklin. Smyth, Life and Writings of Benjamin Franklin, II, 391.

activities of Dr. Barnard and Horace Mann deserve mention. In 1838, Dr. Barnard published in the October number of the Connecticut *Common School Journal*, Professor Stowe's report to the Ohio Legislature on the Prussian schools. In the report emphasis is placed on the value of Drawing and Designing. In the reports on foreign schools which were published within the succeeding years, Dr. Barnard continuously directed attention to the utilitarian side of drawing as a part of public education. This same note was apparent in his public appeal in which he emphasized the value of drawing to the artisan.⁶

Horace Mann also was a valiant advocate of the subject. His ideas were clearly set forth in his Seventh Annual Report which appeared in 1844.

"But suppose it were otherwise and that learning to draw retarded the acquisition of good penmanship, how richly would the learner be compensated by the sacrifice! . . . For the master architect, for the engraver, the engineer, the pattern designer, the draughtsman, moulder, machine builder or head mechanic of any kind, all acknowledge that this art is essential and indispensable. But there is no department of business or condition in life where this accomplishment might not be of utility. Every man should be able to plot a field, to sketch a wood or river, to draw the outline of a simple machine, a piece of household furniture or a farming utensil and to delineate the internal arrangement or construction of a house. . . . Whatever advances the mechanic and manufacturing arts, therefore, is especially important here."⁷

Concerning the influence of Mann, Superintendent Philbrick said, "As one of the results of Mr. Mann's report on foreign education, the school committees of Boston in 1848 placed the word drawing in the list of grammar school studies."⁸

English Influence

In 1851 an event took place which had great significance in this connection. In that year was held the First International Exposition in London. The showing made by the products of the English artisans was so poor in comparison with that made by the exhibits of the continental workers that prompt

⁶ Files of *Barnard's Journals* XXI (entire series) have a summary of European conditions.

⁷ *Life and Works of Horace Mann*, III, 327-9.

⁸ Report of Boston School Committee, 1874.

and decisive action was taken by the English authorities to stimulate new interest in educational means of improving this condition, through the teaching of industrial drawing and design. The experiment attracted a good bit of interest in this country and the experience of England was fully capitalized. From 1857 to 1861 M. A. Dwight published a series of articles on "Art as an important Branch of Education" in Barnard's *American Journal of Education*, which attracted much attention.⁹ Interest grew till in 1860 the Legislature of Massachusetts, largely through the instrumentality of its manufacturing interest, made drawing a permissive study.

Meagre Results

Placing drawing on the permissive list had little real effect either in the earlier case of Boston or in the State at large. Concerning the Boston experience Superintendent Philbrick said: "As the teachers were almost universally ignorant of this branch, and as not the slightest provision was made for teaching it . . . next to nothing came of this action. The prevailing ignorance in regard to the subject was only equalled by the indifference respecting it. If a progressive teacher tried to get up a little drawing in the school, he was likely to get a gentle rebuke from his committee and some blame from his fellow teachers."¹⁰

Divergent Points of View as to Value of Drawing

The reports made by the various cities in this period to the Massachusetts State Board are full of references to the attempts at instruction in this subject. In most cases much space is given to setting forth the advantages to be gained from the pursuit of this study. There was little unanimity, however, in the point of view, except that there was the general fear that the children might waste their time and get only pleasure from the practice. The following is suggestive: "Drawing is always an amusing exercise for children and we think that teachers have allowed it to become too exclusively an amusing exercise."¹¹

⁹ Barnard's *American Journal*, XXII, 225-83. Also IV-VII.

¹⁰ Boston School Report, 1874.

¹¹ Massachusetts School Report, 1863.

This suggestion of the use of drawing as a form of "busy work" has a parallel in the treatment of certain of the newer subjects on the part of the untrained teacher. With the statement of purpose expressed by the school authorities themselves, it is not surprising to find that teachers tended to follow the line of least resistance.

The following extract from the report of Berlin, Massachusetts, in 1864, is suggestive of the range of values ascribed to drawing: "Another branch for which we bespeak encouragement in school and at home, is that of drawing,—map drawing, picture drawing, and all forms of diagrams. It is within the memory of some, when to draw a picture of a horse or dog upon the slate, however soberly, was a serious offence in the school room. Better views prevail. No employment is more profitable or pleasant even to the little scholars in the primer. It employs time and improves the eyes and the hand and the taste. It is vastly helpful in mathematics; above all in geography. The appreciation of the subject in life is manifold. It is not an art useful only to the painter, the architect and the engineer—it belongs to the farmer, the carpenter, the smith and the mechanic. The schoolroom is the place to cultivate it, but it will be found a pleasure everywhere, as well as an art universally useful. Let parents encourage drawing at home. It will afford profitable recreation as well as mental improvement."¹²

The Effects of the French Exhibition of 1867

The French Exhibition of 1867 served to focus attention again on the economic aspect of the subject. The showing which England made at this exhibit indicated that a remarkable degree of progress had been made since the earlier display of 1851. This improvement was in large measure attributed to the increased attention that had been given to industrial drawing and design as a means of education. The whole thing made a great impression, not only in England but in this country. The industrial leaders of Massachusetts were especially impressed with the educational significance. This crystallized in a petition which was sent to the State Legislature in June, 1869, the full text of which follows:

¹² Massachusetts Report, 1864.

" TO THE HONORABLE COURT OF THE STATE OF MASSACHUSETTS :

Your petitioners respectfully represent that every branch of manufacturing in which the citizens of Massachusetts are engaged, requires in the details of the processes connected with it, some knowledge of drawing and other arts of design on the part of the skilled workmen engaged.

At the present time no wide provision is made for instruction in drawing in the public schools.

Our manufacturers therefore compete under disadvantages with the manufacturers of Europe, for in all of the manufacturing countries of Europe free provision is made for instructing workmen of all classes in drawing. At this time nearly all the best draughtsmen in our shops are men thus trained abroad.

In England, within the last ten years, very large additions have been made to the provisions, which were before very generous, for the public instruction of workmen in drawing; your petitioners are assured that boys and girls, by the time they are sixteen years of age, acquire great proficiency in mechanical drawing and in other arts of design.

We are also assured that men and women who have been long engaged in the processes of manufacture learn rapidly, and with pleasure, enough of the arts of design to assist them materially in their work.

For such reasons we ask that the Board of Education may be directed to report in detail to the next general court some definite plan for introducing schools for drawing,—free to all men, women and children, in all towns of the Commonwealth of more than five thousand inhabitants."¹³

Results of Petition

This clean cut statement of the economic value of drawing, supported by a group of highly respected industrial leaders served to generate a pressure which brought drawing into the public mind in a way hitherto unknown; at last the subject had a sanction which was calculated to win popular approval. The final outcome of this petition and the agitation which followed was the famous Act of 1870, which read:

An Act, relating to free instruction in drawing—Be it enacted, etc., as follows:

Section 1. The first section of Chapter Thirty-eight of the general statutes is hereby amended so as to include drawing among the branches

¹³ Bailey, *Drawing*, No. 1-15.

of learning which are by said section required to be taught in the Public Schools.

Section 2. Any city or town may, and every city or town having more than ten thousand inhabitants shall, annually make provision for giving free instruction in industrial or mechanical drawing to persons over fifteen years of age either in day or evening schools, under the direction of the School Committee.

Section 3. This Act shall take effect upon its passage (approved May 16, 1870).¹⁴

It is interesting to note the compulsory provision made in the matter of instruction in drawing in cities with a population above ten thousand. Especial attention is also called to the description of the subject "mechanical or industrial" which is in exact accordance with the arguments which were being put forth in favor of its introduction.

Transfer of English Leader

The enactment of this law was followed by the establishment of the Massachusetts Normal Art School in 1873. Walter Smith, who had been closely identified with the same field in England, was placed in general charge of the administration of this school and of the provisions of the law in Boston and in the State. Smith thus was in a position to wield a tremendous influence in determining the direction toward which instruction should go. Within the next decade he was the leading figure in the whole movement. He lectured widely and wrote much. His manual published in 1873 served as a guide in many other sections of the country.

Industrial Nature of Drawing

Concerning the industrial nature of this manual, Henry Turner Bailey said: "Mr. Smith's Manual of 1873 was called a manual of 'Free Hand Drawing and Designing.' Mechanical drawing as such, was not mentioned therein as an essential factor in elementary instruction. In glancing through the plates of that book, however, one is impressed with the mechanical character of all the illustrations. Not a single drawing has a free hand appearance; on the contrary, ruled construction lines

¹⁴ Bailey, Drawing, No. 1-15.

abound, and the terminology employed in the text smacks of the drafting room rather than the studio."¹⁵

Thus by concerted action the industrial leaders were able in a way to transplant the system which had been successful in England, in a comparatively short time.

Attempts Elsewhere

Meanwhile scattering attempts had been made in other sections of this country. Drawing was included in the list of subjects in the first New York High School for Boys which was opened in 1825.¹⁶

The report of the Philadelphia schools for 1840 in discussing the changes in the Central High School of that city, says: "The department of drawing and writing by Rembrandt Peale went into operation in February of this year."¹⁷

It is interesting to note the connection of penmanship and drawing. These were thought to have much in common in the early days. This served as one of the practical sanctions for drawing instruction. In 1842 Rembrandt Peale urged the necessity of courses in drawing in the other schools of Philadelphia. However his offer of gratuitous service in superintending the introduction of the subject in the elementary schools received little encouragement. Although the work was offered in the High School for many years, the attempts in the elementary schools were soon abandoned. Peale is said to have had two great ambitions: one to introduce drawing instruction to the masses; the other to paint a creditable portrait of Washington. In the latter he was quite successful as the Peale portrait of the first president is well known.¹⁸

By 1848 William Minifie had organized a systematic course of instruction in the Baltimore schools. He was soon dismissed however.¹⁹

In 1849 Cleveland introduced drawing as a regular subject of instruction. A specialist was employed who secured excellent

¹⁵ Bailey, *Drawing*, No. 3, 94.

¹⁶ First Annual Report of the High School Society, 6-7.

¹⁷ Report of the Philadelphia Schools, 1840, 18.

¹⁸ Hart, in a letter quoted in Clarke, *Drawing in American Schools*, 15.

¹⁹ Clarke, *Drawing in American Schools*, 31-32.

results; however, not until two decades later do we find a permanent policy relating to the subject.²⁰

The State Legislature of California included drawing as one of the list of required subjects.²¹

In 1862 drawing was added to the curriculum of the Cincinnati schools. Two years later two special teachers were appointed to instruct in this subject. In 1868 a superintendent of the subject was appointed. A little later a full corps of assistants was added so that by 1870 the work was under full sway.²²

Thus it is seen that in the latter part of the sixties the forces which had been operative in Massachusetts had been to a greater or less extent operating in other sections. When to this fertile field of suggestibility was added a powerful example for imitation, as in the case of the advance steps taken in Massachusetts, it is small wonder that we find drawing as one of the chief centers of interest and discussion in the decade which followed. As is to be expected on account of the prevailing economic sanction, this influence spread most rapidly to the urban population given over to industrial pursuits.

In 1875 the New York Legislature passed a law requiring instruction in drawing in the elementary schools. The reports of state and city superintendents of schools teem with recommendations relative to the subject.

As the movement gained headway under the economic impetus of the seventies, there was a rapid shifting on the part of the leaders in education. From the report of Henry Kiddle, of New York City, 1875, the following account is taken: "The results (in drawing) have varied much in different schools, and, under the impression that the system pursued is not sufficiently uniform and progressive, the Superintendent recommends that the course be revised and the system be re-organized on the *industrial* basis now popular in Massachusetts and elsewhere."²³

Similar illustrations of the adoption of the new point of view abound.

²⁰ Freese, *Early History of Cleveland Public Schools*.

²¹ California Statutes, 1851, Ch. 126, Art. 7, Sec. 2.

²² Shotwell, *Schools of Cincinnati*.

²³ Quoted in Commissioner's Report, 1875, 295.

Impetus Given to Drawing by Centennial Exposition

The Centennial Exposition at Philadelphia in 1876 contributed powerfully to this movement. Not only did the exhibit of the foreign nations attract great attention, but the showing made by the exhibitors in this country served as an illustration of possibilities to be attained that had hitherto been undreamed of. Smith's exhibit of the work of the Massachusetts schools created much enthusiasm. From this time on there has been a steady increase in the number of schools providing instruction in this branch and in the amount of time and money devoted to it.²⁴

Varying Conceptions

Thus did the forces accumulate which brought drawing into the schools. As in the case of other movements of a similar nature this gathered together a group of people, who, although united in their demand for drawing in the schools, had fundamentally different conceptions of the means and the ends involved. The manufacturers saw in this an opportunity of getting a superior type of artisan. The student of social problems looked to this as a means of improving the earning capacity and usefulness of the workingman. Judging from the accounts of the difficulties found in securing a satisfactory attendance at the early evening schools, the workingman himself saw little in it.²⁵

Reception within the School

Interest attaches to the attitude of the school people toward the new subject. A study of the reports and addresses of the period reveals the same general spirit as was noted in the case of music. The teachers were for the most part either unable or unwilling to undertake the added burden.

The practical end involved in instruction in industrial drawing not only involved the necessity of a fair measure of technical skill on the part of the teacher, but there was also the necessity for building up a class-room technique from the standpoint of teaching method.

²⁴ Cubberley, *Changing Conceptions of Education*, 40. Dexter, *History of Education in United States*, 404. Later tables in this study reveal the spread of this practice.

²⁵ Reports, Commissioner of Education of the period.

Neglect on the Part of Regular Teachers

It is not surprising that the regular teacher tended to neglect the work under one pretext or another. In 1874 Superintendent Philbrick of Boston gave a full account of this neglect and the attempt on the part of the school committee to bring added pressure on the teachers by making it obligatory upon each in the primary and grammar schools to give one hour each week to drawing instruction.²⁶

This neglect was in general quite irrespective of the fact that the subject was officially included in the curriculum. Walter Perry whose work was of such nature that he was in a position to have a fairly accurate view of this neglect, said in 1887: "I think I am safe in saying that in more than half of the schools that claim to teach drawing, the subject is merely mentioned in the course of study and not much else can be said of it. The teachers do little or nothing with it."²⁷

Difficulty in Sticking to Industrial Purpose

From the published utterances of the various leaders in this branch of instruction, the impression is gained that much difficulty was found in keeping the work in the school clearly headed on industrial lines. L. S. Thompson, of Indiana, in 1881 said: "By industrial drawing, I mean the study of form as exhibited in natural and artificial objects When properly taught it is more nearly an industrial education within itself than any other one study, and yet in a majority of schools it is regarded as something merely ornamental in character, having little or no practical value."²⁸

Intellectual Value Uppermost

Of this tendency to break away from the "industrial" idea of drawing, Miss Mary Hicks, of Boston, said in 1903 before the International Congress of Education: "Everywhere the work of the supervisor of drawing was to direct the drawing mainly toward industrial design as a means of improving the industrial products of the country, increasing the wage earning

²⁶ Boston School Report, 1874.

²⁷ Proc. N. E. A., 1887, 573-7.

²⁸ Proc. N. E. A., 1881, 248.

power of the people and adding to the material prosperity. Then came the idea that drawing was a mode of expressing thought and that hence it should be cultivated as a means of mental development." This is not surprising in view of the fundamentally intellectual nature of the school room and its traditions. The following quotation from a school superintendent of Pennsylvania is suggestive of this change: "The old style drawing consisted principally of picture making from copies. The new is an intellectual study; the thought, ingenuity, and invention of the scholar in the line of art as applied to industrial pursuits. The influence of this branch is manifold; it especially develops: (1) Observation; (2) forethought; (3) painstaking; (4) taste, imagination; (5) memory of forms; (6) power to discriminate—judgment; (7) ease and precision in the movements of the hand. No profession, calling or business can be brought to mind that does not call for such mental and physical culture. As drawing is opposed to carelessness, haste, bad forms, and clumsy execution, it is a valuable art in teaching writing."²⁹

In the last sentence there is a survival of one of the early sanctions for instruction in drawing: namely that it might be an aid to penmanship. Here we also find a clear acceptance of the prevailing conception of the doctrine of formal discipline.

Mental Discipline in Drawing

In 1888 Colonel I. Edward Clarke of the United States Bureau of Education, who had spent several years in gathering together the material relative to Art and Industry in connection with the schools of this country and was without doubt better acquainted with the situation than any other man of the period, thus summarized the prevailing belief:

"The value of drawing as a means of mental discipline is believed to be not inferior to that of any of the studies at present included in the curriculum of the Public Schools. It is, therefore, not only because of its direct application to the industries and art and hence of economic value to the pupil, that this study of drawing has a claim to admission into the public schools. Its value as a means of developing and training the intellectual faculties is so well established, from the pro-

²⁹ Report of Schools, Erie, Pennsylvania, 1877-8.

fessional point of view of the teacher, and, regarded merely as an instrument of pedagogics, the progressive system of . . . industrial drawing can readily establish its claim for introduction into the elementary course of instruction on educational grounds alone. . . . In urging that industrial drawing be taught in all public schools, it has been necessary to so emphasize the practical character and economic value of the study that equally just claims of other studies may seem to have been neglected."³⁰

From the foregoing it can be seen that the outside forces which were operative in the widespread introduction of drawing in the public schools in the seventies were almost wholly economic. The introduction started on a purely utilitarian or industrial basis and was influenced largely by English thought.³¹

When this subject came under the influence of the traditions of the school it was subject in a large measure to a different interpretation. There was a constant tendency to treat it apart from its industrial and utilitarian significance. There was a widespread tendency to look for purely intellectual values in the light of formal training of the eye and hand.

The varying interpretations given to the subject are reflected in the changing titles used. At first it was known as Industrial Art drawing. The word art quickly lost its significance and the term became Industrial drawing with a rather clear implication. To-day the word industrial has dropped almost entirely out of use and the subject is simply known as drawing. The present tendency is distinctly toward the art side. It would be of interest to know what, if any, relation exists between the decline of the industrial phase and the rapid increase in the proportion of women as special teachers or supervisors of the subject. Reference to a later section shows that in 1908, eighty-five per cent of these were women.

Plan of Administration

Reference has already been made to the fact that there was great difficulty in getting the regular teacher to undertake seriously the burden of responsibility in regard to instruction in this subject. The number of cities employing special teachers

³⁰ Clark, Art and Industry, Part I, CXXII.

³¹ MacAllister, Commissioner of Education Report, 1894-5, 793-803.

and supervisors has steadily increased. In 1888 about fifty per cent of the cities of Massachusetts provided special teachers or supervisors of drawing. In 1899 regular instruction in drawing was given to ninety-eight per cent of the pupils of the State. Ninety per cent of these pupils were receiving this instruction under special teaching or supervision.³²

The growth of this practice has been rapid throughout the whole country within the last few years.³³

Summary

The early pioneer life was not conducive to the development of interest in drawing as it was then interpreted.

The early scattering attempts at the introduction of drawing as a part of the school work, failed because of the popular prejudice against drawing considered as an accomplishment. Dr. Barnard and Horace Mann directed attention to the value of drawing as an aid to the artisan. In doing this they cited the example of certain foreign countries.

The reaction in England following the London Exhibit of 1851 in which drawing and design received much attention, served to increase interest in this country in the economic aspect of the work.

The English Exhibit at the French Exhibition of 1867 so enthused certain manufacturing interests of Massachusetts that advanced steps were taken to provide for general instruction in drawing.

The English influence was further increased through the activity of Walter Smith.

The Philadelphia Exposition seemed to direct popular attention to the value of drawing in such a way that a widespread introduction of the subject into the public schools followed.

The traditions of the school were such that the industrial side of drawing was pushed to the margin while emphasis was given to the intellectual and aesthetic values. The burden of responsibility as in the case of music has been placed in charge of special teachers and supervisors rather than of the regular teacher.

³² Henry Turner Bailey, *Drawing*, No. 3, 98.

³³ See Chap. VIII.

CHAPTER IV

MANUAL TRAINING

Social and Economic Changes

Inquiry into the sanction back of the introduction of manual training into the schools leads one to a close inspection of the changes in the economic and social life of the people during the latter part of the last century.

The nineteenth century marked the rise and development of a new type of industrial activity in the country. The gradual shift away from agrarian and purely commercial interests to that of manufacturing which has been such a marked feature of the last half century, had scarcely begun by the close of the War of 1812.¹

With this change in economic activity urbanization steadily increased. The massing of population brought new problems, opportunities and responsibilities. As the number of people increased in these units, there was a greater opportunity for division of labor in all lines of human activity.

With this has come about almost the complete disappearance of the old system of apprenticeship. As the struggle became more refined new aspects appeared on the surface. Under the new order every man became a potential producing agent in this struggle. In industrial centers this has, as was seen in connection with the development of drawing, pointed toward the desirability of giving special instruction to this potential producer that would increase his producing power. Owing to the complexities of the new industrial order, conditions were not favorable to a restoration of the apprenticeship system; nor were the manufacturers willing to bear the expense connected with special schools of their own.

¹ Carlton, *Economic Influences on Education*, Bulletin University of Wisconsin, 1908, 629-633.

Relation of Manual Training to Drawing

Reference has been made in a preceding chapter to the part played by the industrial forces in the introduction of drawing and the industrial turn which was at first given to this subject. The relation which existed between the early development of manual training and industrial drawing seemed quite close.

It was but a short step from the working drawing to the actual construction of the model. "One of the most striking and significant results of the experiment begun in Boston in 1870 by the teaching of industrial drawing to the public school children of that city, has been the widespread interest awakened throughout the United States in the further development of industrial training of children. No sooner was it shown that it was possible to give to the children in the public schools some elementary training of the hands and the eyes, than a movement began in many places to teach actual trades and handicrafts to the children while in school."²

The following quotations are typical of this period and show the relation which was felt to exist at the time between drawing and manual training:

"Drawing gives the qualifications of a good mechanic except the practice. . . . In order to more fully carry out the ideas involved therein, the board has established a manual training school for the more perfect and symmetrical development of the hand and the eye."³

"Instruction in drawing and the introduction of object teaching have proved of the greatest advantage, and lead directly and naturally to those subjects and methods now under discussion. (Manual training.)"⁴

The Commissioner's report for 1888 gives a table showing the status of manual training in the public elementary schools of the time. This fact indicates that in fully eighty per cent of the cities manual training was introduced after drawing.⁵

Some school reports called the new subject "realized drawing." Detailed study of the reports of the period indicate very

²Clark, *Art and Industry*, Part I, ix.

³Superintendent's Report, Newbury, N. Y., 1885. Quoted from Commissioner of Education Report, 1887, 783.

⁴Course of Study of Board of Education of New York City. Quoted from Commissioner of Education Report, 1887, 783.

⁵*Ibid.*, 1888, 875.

clearly the close relation which existed between the subject of drawing and manual training in the mind of the public.

Effect of Centennial Exhibition

Attention has already been directed to the stimulus which was given the cause of education for industrial purposes by the expositions of 1851, 1867, and 1876. The industrial leaders saw in the introduction of industrial art a means of adding to the creative ability of the great mass of working men. They expected to provide a new lever to be used in the ever-increasing struggle for industrial supremacy. In Massachusetts where their struggles were felt most keenly, this end was to be obtained not only by providing additional instruction for the children in the schools, but by the additional provision for the producing population in the form of free evening schools.

The Centennial Exhibition in Philadelphia in 1876 was of far-reaching significance not only in the widespread interest that was created in drawing, but here the American public had a chance to see the American products in competition with those produced in foreign countries. Clarke has called especial attention to the significance of the Exhibition relative to the new interest created in skillfully made products, in which utility was coupled with beauty.⁶ In comparison with certain foreign goods ours seemed very crude. The interests which had watched the progress of England during the period preceding were given an additional object lesson in the case of Russia and Sweden. "The Centennial Exposition in Philadelphia in 1876 was a revelation to the American people, not only of the glory of the graphic and plastic arts, as shown by the world's great living artists and sculptors and painters; but, also, of the variety and beauty imparted to articles of usefulness and ornament by the wonderfully artistic weavers, potters and metal-workers of the Orient, and by the skilled art workers of Europe."⁷

In addition to these products the Russian and Swedish exhibit of educational methods involving technical and manual training attracted much attention and suggested with renewed emphasis

⁶ Art and Industry, Part II, LXXXVII-XCVII.

⁷ *Ibid.* Also Mon. 14 in Butler, Education in U. S., 49.

the possibilities of educational endeavors. Educational writers have quite generally noted the spread of interest in manual training following the Exposition. Commissioner Brown says: "The European manual training exhibits at the Centennial Exhibition in Philadelphia in 1876, gave a strong impetus to a movement, already under discussion and even tentatively begun, toward the establishment of manual training schools in American cities."⁸ Dexter says of this same influence: "At the same exhibition (Centennial) an elaborate display of models illustrating the method ('Russian' tool work) was made by the Russian school, and we may perhaps date the real beginning of educational manual training from that year."⁹

Beginnings of Technical Education

As suggested above there had been comparatively little done in this country along the line of technical education. The Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute had been established in 1824 at Troy for the purpose of "instructing persons who may choose to apply themselves in the application of science to the common purposes of life."¹⁰ Little advance was made in the provision for this type of instruction during the next forty years.¹¹

In 1862 Congress passed the Morrill Act, which made provision for the distribution of thirteen millions of acres of land for the maintenance of a college in each state. These colleges were to be chiefly centers of instruction in the agricultural and mechanic arts. They were from the first closely affiliated with the manufacturing and agricultural interests. From these institutions have gone out a steady stream of men, who have for the most part taken their places as officers in the great industrial army. Their contribution to the modern industrial development has been enormous.¹²

The Worcester Free Institute opened its doors in 1868 with this object: "The aim of this school shall ever be the instruction of the youth in these branches of education not usually

⁸ Brown, *Making of Our Middle Schools*, 401.

⁹ Dexter, *History of Education in the U. S.*, 409.

¹⁰ Extract from a letter quoted in Dexter, *History of Education in the United States*, 346.

¹¹ *Ibid.*, 344.

¹² Brown, *Making of Our Middle Schools*, 337. Clarke, *Art and Industry*, Part III, X, XI.

taught in the public schools, which are essential and best adapted to train the young for practical life." This school was quick to respond to the Russian influence and served to make popular the cause of technical education from this standpoint.

Secondary Manual Training Schools Supported by Economic Forces

Through the influence of the Centennial Exhibition and the enthusiastic leadership of C. M. Woodward, a small group of interested men provided for the establishment of the St. Louis Manual Training School in 1879. This school was of secondary grade, the purpose of which, as stated by Woodward, included a somewhat broad aim, that made appeal to the educational, social, and economic sanction.¹³

In 1884 Baltimore opened the first manual training school in the country which was supported and controlled by the public school authorities.¹⁴ The argument set forth in the resolution of the school committee preceding this establishment was economic and social: "It is well known that a number of the boys and girls leave the public schools of Baltimore without any knowledge of the mechanic arts or other industrial pursuits, and find themselves at once in the front of the realities of life, destitute of the means of earning a livelihood; and that it is known that such boys and girls are unable to apply the principles taught them to practical advantage in life, and that in order to fit them as quickly as possible for self-support, the subject be referred to a committee of three for investigation and report."¹⁵

A similar school was started the same year by the Commercial Club of Chicago. The year following, the Cleveland manual training school was incorporated by a group of business men.¹⁶ These schools which were of secondary rank were almost wholly established through private initiative operating under an economic sanction. They served as models and with their exhibits and popular sanction created much enthusiasm for

¹³ Woodward, *The Manual Training School*, 3-11. Ham., *Manual Training*, 332-336.

¹⁴ Clark, *Art and Industry*, Part I, 357.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, Part II, 358.

¹⁶ *Ibid.*, Part II, 438-448.

the movement. The public school authorities soon either assumed the responsibility for the maintenance of these schools, as in the case of Cleveland and Toledo, or established parallel courses as in the case of Chicago.¹⁷ Within a short time manual training high schools were established in a number of the larger cities.¹⁸

Humanitarian Activities

Not only did the economic factors accumulate which would provide a background for a popular response with the introduction of manual training, but other forces of a different nature were at work. The humanitarian or philanthropic movements which were instrumental in the organization and maintenance of the public school societies of the early part of the century, were still at work. This brought together groups of people who were primarily interested in the actual alleviation of the distress which had become so apparent under the new social order. The problem of life in the city for the poorer classes made a constant appeal to these people. This problem appeared not only to involve conditions that threatened the very institutional life of the country through the herding together of masses of unskilled laborers but the attendant penury and suffering in the families concerned also made a vital appeal. Manual labor was one of the features of the Fellenburg movement which spread rapidly in this country from 1825 to 1840. The promoters of these schools hoped to make them in a measure self-supporting by having the students do a regular amount of manual labor in connection with the school plant. The plan was not unlike the one in operation to-day at Tuskegee. The manual side of the movement was not altogether successful and soon dropped out of these schools except in the case of schools for dependents. Nevertheless, their success both in this country and in Europe served as a model for continuous imitation.¹⁹

These schools were better adapted to the protective than to the educative types of instruction. Most of the charity schools developed during the period and since that time have been of

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, Part II, 669-678.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, 191, 405-428.

¹⁹ Monroe, *Text-book in the History of Education*, 723-724.

this type. The Children's Aid Society, which successfully operates similar schools even at the present time, established an industrial school as early as 1825. The humanitarian spirit was manifest in the establishment of such schools in all parts of the country.

Practical Nature of Instruction in Charity Schools

Unlike the children in the public schools, these children came from homes of about the same social and economic levels. The immediate as well as the future needs of these children stood out much more definitely than in the case of the public school children where home conditions and future occupations range through the whole field. Thus the very nature and purpose of these mission schools favored variations from type in method and in subject matter. Hence it is not surprising that these schools were the scenes of early modification toward the ultra-practical in education.

Kitchen Garden Movement

As a center from which radiated influences which wrought great changes in school practice, the Wilson Industrial School for girls is an excellent example. This mission school was established in 1854 in New York City.²⁰ From the first the work was successful. In 1876 Miss Emily Huntington started a movement in this school known as the Kitchen Garden Movement. This involved a form of industrial training for girls which became popular in all parts of the country. Kitchen Garden schools were established and a Kitchen Garden journal was published.

Industrial Education Association

The movement had attained such proportions that by 1884 the members of the Kitchen Garden Association of New York felt the necessity for reorganization on broader terms. The famed Industrial Education Association of New York was the outcome. Its purpose and plan can best be ascertained from their own statement:

²⁰ Clark, *Art and Industry*, Part II, 305-306.

First. To obtain and disseminate information upon industrial education and to stimulate *public opinion* in its favor.

Second. To invite co-operation between existing organizations engaged in any form of industrial training.

Third. To train women and girls in domestic economy and to promote the training of both sexes, in such industries as shall enable those trained to become self-supporting.

Fourth. To study the methods and systems of industrial training and secure their introduction into schools; also when expedient to form special classes and schools for such instruction.

Fifth. To provide instructors for schools and classes and if necessary to train teachers for the work.²¹

This was certainly an ambitious and comprehensive program, more especially when considered in the light of the fact that the movement traced its origin to the mission school. The results were phenomenal. All of the recognized channels for spreading the influence were utilized. The organization gained the prestige which goes with a distinguished list of members and officers. The press was utilized to the maximum for publicity. Scholarly articles appeared in magazines and exhibitions were held of products from the various schools in the country, to which excursions were run for the purpose of interesting the outside school superintendents.

Pressure for Manual Training in New York City Schools

Concerning the attempts to get the subject introduced into the schools of New York City the following is indicative: "Mature deliberation convinced the committee that the best way to secure the desired result would be to establish centers where by practical experiment the value and feasibility of manual training could be demonstrated. Recognizing *the power that would accrue from such a movement by attempting it at once* with the public schools of New York City, application was made to the Board of Education for the use of a school building one afternoon of each week for the purpose of holding classes, after the regular school hours, in sewing, domestic economy, designing, modelling, simple carpentry, and the use of tools; the Association to assume entire care and expense and the

²¹ First Annual Report of the Industrial Education Association, April, 1885, 31.

classes to be open at all times to the inspection of teachers and instructors of the public schools and members of the Board of Education. The petition was signed by prominent citizens, representing a variety of influential interests and a strong public sentiment in favor of the introduction of manual training."²²

Not only did this enthusiastic group of leaders realize the value which would accrue from having such a powerful example for imitation as New York, but they knew how to organize their forces in such a way that the appeal would be most powerful before the school authorities of this city.

Introduction in New York Schools

Although the response was not immediate, it is not surprising to find that in 1887 the committee on the course of study recommended that the subject be introduced into the schools. "Your committee during the deliberation have adopted the following resolutions:

Resolved, That the kind of instruction known as manual training should be introduced into the primary and grammar schools."

This was accompanied by a long series of resolutions setting forth in detail the plans to be pursued in connection with instruction and administration of the work. Two of these are of interest in connection with this study.

"*Resolved*, That the instruction in workshop, cooking and sewing, should be under the direction of special teachers, who should be licensed, employed and paid in the manner now provided for special teachers.

Resolved, That to secure efficient instruction an additional assistant superintendent should be appointed, whose special duty should be to supervise, under the city superintendent, all the work in manual training in the Primary and Grammar Schools."²³

Thus within a period of a little more than two years after the organization of this Industrial Association, the introduction had been accomplished in the metropolis of the country. The student of educational sociology finds in this one of the most striking instances of the registration of outside opinion upon the curriculum of the schools.

²² First Annual Report, Industrial Education Association, 1885, Subcommittee on Industries.

²³ Quoted in appendix to Art and Industry, 1208.

Training School for Teachers

The work of the Industrial Education Association soon demanded a new line of activity. With the enthusiasm which was created calls came for teachers. The following is taken from the Third Annual Report for the year ending March 31, 1887:

"During the Winter it became apparent that while the Association was meeting with no small success in its efforts to spread abroad the principles which it advocated, it was at the same time creating a demand for trained teachers, to meet which there was an inadequate supply. The question arose where and by whom were these teachers to be trained. Manifestly this training should and must be done by the Association. . . . It became evident that such a scheme must assume the proportions of a training college, needing the guidance of a trained and expert educator. A president must be found, and a search was at once begun for the right man for the place, and this man the Board of Trustees believe it has found in the person of Dr. Nicholas Murray Butler, the President-Elect."²⁴

Thus were the preliminary steps taken in the organization of a school which later became Teachers College, Columbia University.

Spread of Influence

Such zeal coupled with skillful organization and communication of purpose was sure of its reward. The enthusiasm was contagious and the general plan of organization served as a splendid example. Largely through the influence of the New York Industrial Association, an Industrial Education Association was formed in New Jersey with the governor of the State as the presiding officer.²⁵ The Industrial Association of Baltimore²⁶ was organized in 1887 with an imposing list of members. Similar associations were developed in many of the urban centers within a short time. Many of the associations which had been founded a little earlier for the purpose of agitation in favor of kindergartens, now turned their attention to the new movement.²⁷

²⁴ *Ibid.*, Part II, 295.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, 307-309.

²⁶ *Ibid.*, 316.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, 317.

Private Initiative in Boston

The movement in Boston traces its beginning to the establishment of the "Whittling School" in 1871. This school, which was organized by a few private citizens, attempted to acquaint a group of boys with the use of wood-cutting tools. The school was operated for five seasons in the chapel of a church, at the end of which time it was merged with another industrial school which had been similarly formed a little later. With the merging of these two schools the Industrial Education Society was formed to take charge of the two schools. Sufficient backing was then secured to get the city to grant the use of a school room for the work. A definite course of study was prepared and the work prospered.²⁸

Boston School Committee Assumes Responsibility

As in the case of the New York association the attempt was soon made to get the school to assume the responsibility for the work. Concerning these attempts, Superintendent Seaver of the Boston Schools says:

"This Industrial School Association having for several seasons successfully conducted schools for instruction in the use of wood working tools, and having prepared a manual of proved educational value, offered to the Board the use of the apparatus and petitioned that the master of the Dwight and Sherwin schools be permitted to employ these for the benefit of such of these pupils as would in their judgment be best fitted for such instruction or most deserving of it. The association offered to defray all expenses of the cost of tuition for the year. This generous offer was accepted by the Board."²⁹

Forces Outside of School Back of Manual Training Movement

Thus did the economic and humanitarian forces join hands in the development of the propaganda. Manual training for the secondary schools was perhaps more directly the outcome of economic forces, while the agitation in favor of manual training for the elementary schools was materially helped by the humanitarian forces. It is to be borne in mind that this activity was for the most part confined to agencies outside of the school group.

²⁸ *Ibid.*, 13-15.

²⁹ Report of Boston School Committee, 1882, 16.

"In most places where the manual training experiment is being tried in this country, it is through the philanthropy and generosity of private individuals. Even where it is closely connected with public school systems in several cities, this has been brought about largely by private gifts. It has come to certain schools and cities as the kindergarten system has come; in some places, first through enthusiasm and munificence of private individuals, and then, after proving its claim upon all interests, it has been gladly adopted by boards of education and supported from public funds. Manual training can be thus introduced wherever even a few have an appreciation of its benefits and can enlist private capital in its behalf. In introducing it in this way, what is needed is energy, enthusiasm, conviction, fanaticism, if you will, and money. . . . When manual training is to be inaugurated through the majority of the people by taxation of themselves, the case is somewhat different. . . . This, then, is the first thing to look to—the preparation of the public mind."⁸⁰

Opposition of Teachers

The following additional quotation from Superintendent H. W. Compton of Toledo is significant of the attitude of the teacher toward the whole movement. The fact that Mr. Compton had been closely associated with the movement both in the introduction in his own city and in the general agitation gives increased value to his testimony. "The worst foes of industrial education are those who ought to be its best friends, and they are among the teaching force of the country. . . . They would like to remain monarchs of all they supervise, and manual work seems like an encroachment upon their absolutism and self-sufficiency."⁸¹

The most severe criticism was made on the movement by some of the school men. The following from Superintendent Marble suggests the point of attack: "The demand for manual training does not come from the people for whose children the training is designed; it comes chiefly from a class of self-constituted philanthropists who are intent upon providing the 'masses' with an education which shall fit them for their sphere."⁸²

⁸⁰ Compton, Circular of Information, United States Bureau of Education, 1889, number 2, 174.

⁸¹ *Ibid.*, 175.

⁸² Quoted in Art and Industry, Part II, 917.

The means utilized to attract attention was also criticized by Marble. "The apparent call for such training is created by a few voices echoing and re-echoing the refrain and magnifying the few experiments that are being tried into a general educational movement. Magazine writers and newspaper paragraphers reiterate the same old strains in praise of the little shop at Gloucester, the Boston basements and the Toledo movement just as if they were general and representative."³³

Relation of Kindergarten Movement to Manual Training

However, certain forces were operative within the school group which did provide a favorable background for the introduction of manual training.

The spread of the kindergarten movement contributed much in the matter of the teacher's attitude toward the new subject. The philosophy of Froebel which became prevalent with the introduction of the kindergarten furnished a basis for the introduction of manual training which made a fine appeal to the educator who had become familiar with this doctrine. The doctrine of self-activity gave a new dignity to all forms of expression. In his Educational Laws, Froebel said: "At the present time Art alone can be truly called free activity, but every human work corresponds more or less with creative activity, and this is necessary in order to make man the image of his Divine Creator—a creator on his own part in miniature."³⁴

As early as 1878 C. M. Woodward in his famous St. Louis address said: "The manual training education which begins in the kindergarten before the children are able to read a word, should never cease."³⁵

Attitude of Felix Adler

One of the clearest examples of this intimate relation between the kindergarten and manual training is in connection with the "Workingmen's School" which was opened in 1880 by the Ethical Culture Society of New York. The first pamphlet issued in 1881 contains this statement:

³³ Report of Schools, Worcester, Massachusetts, 1885.

³⁴ Froebel, Laws.

³⁵ Woodward, Manual Training School, 286.

"The Workingman's School and the Free Kindergarten form one institution. The children are admitted at the age of three to the Kindergarten. They are graduated from it at six and enter the Workingman's School. They remain in the school till they are thirteen or fourteen years of age. Thereafter those who show decided ability receive higher technical instruction."⁸⁶

Felix Adler, the director, thus outlined his method in his widely quoted address given before the Ethical Culture Society, New York City, October 24, 1880:

"We lend moreover an entirely new import to the method of industrial education in the school. We are seeking to apply the principles which ought to be at the foundation of every modern scheme of education: namely, that, as experiment conjoined with observation is necessary to the discovery of truth, so object creating must supplement object teaching in that re-discovery of truths which it is the purpose of all education to facilitate."⁸⁷

Of his creative method he says:

"At present still another step must be taken, *viz.*, from the mere observation to the production of things as a means of acquiring knowledge; and the taking of this step will mark another epoch in pedagogy. Froebel began to apply the principle of the creative method in his kindergarten. But the kindergarten system covers only three years of the child's life while for the school age proper no valuable and tangible formulation of the creative principle has yet been given. Here the work remains to be done and the experiment of which this article speaks is an attempt to do it."⁸⁸

Attitude of Nicholas Murray Butler

As further evidence of the close relation which existed between the kindergarten movement and the reception of manual training, the words of President Nicholas Murray Butler are especially valuable. "Froebel in his kindergarten reduced theory to practice and in the kindergarten all manual training as well as all rational and systematic education has its basis. But Froebel's work did not include the development of a scheme of manual training for older pupils. The next step was to recognize the unity of principle which underlay the kinder-

⁸⁶ Quoted in Art and Industry, Part II, 464.

⁸⁷ Quoted in Clark, Art and Industry, Part II, 478.

⁸⁸ *Princeton Review*, March, 1883.

garten at one end of the educational scheme and the manual training school at the other; it was observed that both recognized the activities and the expressive powers as well as the receptivities and assimilative powers. It was seen that the kindergarten and the manual training school were evidences of one and the same movement, though appearing at different points on the line."³⁹

Commentary of United States Commissioner of Education

Commissioner Dawson, of the United States Bureau of Education, in commenting on this relation said: "It appears to us doubtful whether manual training owes more to the kindergarten for theory, or the kindergarten to manual training for success. In brief, a series of arguments might be instituted: What is manual training as a theory of education without the theory of Froebel? Would the kindergarten have progressed so fast of late had it not been brought into notice by its 'occupations' being adopted by manual training; and last but not least, had manual training been generally understood to mean education and not industrial training would it have met with such great success?"⁴⁰

In the light of the foregoing testimony it seems safe to draw the conclusion that manual training was modified directly through the influence of the prevailing kindergarten theory.

Manual Training Interpreted in the Light of the Intellectual Tradition of the School

Another factor which tended to influence the attitude of the schoolmaster toward manual training was the prevailing psychological belief in formal discipline. This doctrine fitted admirably into the propaganda for a trained hand, eye and brain, and did much to provide a popular sanction for the new subject within the school. By placing a purely intellectual value on this work, instruction in it might be provided without conflict with the intellectual traditions of the school.

³⁹ 102d Annual Report, Regents of New York University, 17-29.

⁴⁰ Commissioner's Report, 1888, 820.

Attitude of Charles W. Eliot and Others

The following quotations are suggestive of this influence. President Eliot in an address before a manual training conference held in Boston in 1891 said:

"Never admit that manual training is anything distinguished from or in opposition to mental training. In the skill of the artist's hand, in the mechanical, accurate movements of the mechanic's arm, in the acute observation through the physician's eye or ear, there is always mind. Therefore there is no opposition between manual training on the one hand and mental training on the other. We are simply training another kind of faculty—not memory, but discrimination, observation and correct perception."⁴¹

C. R. Richards said before the same conference:

"The fitness of every exercise (in manual training) must be judged by the degree in which it advances disciplinary or intellectual ends, and by no other standard."⁴²

Daniel Jones, master of the Lowell School of Boston, gave utterance to the following, which shows this same determination to admit the work only in its intellectual demand:

"We welcome this manual training just so far as it is an educational power and no further. Nothing is to be crowded out of the regular school work to give it a place. We want no more of it than will awaken the mind and thereby aid in developing the intellectual process."⁴³

In summarizing the work of this conference Mr. Ames said:

"It is not possible, I think, that we should get the best results out of manual training unless we continually hold manual training as one contribution to human advancement, regarding it purely according to its educative value. This has been the keynote of the conference—a note which needs to be heard far and wide and which belongs to each of us to take up and try to propagate. Manual training is not simply a provision by which the children of the poor shall be put in the way of making a living and be serviceable to the community."⁴⁴

Here is the determination expressed to ignore even the humanitarian value of the subject, in favor of the purely educa-

⁴¹ Conference on Manual Training, edited by I. C. Barrows, Boston, 1891, 13.

⁴² *Ibid.*, 104.

⁴³ *Ibid.*, 114.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, 137.

tional value. Another view which is quite similar is that which follows, taken from one of the tracts of the New York Industrial Education Association: "Many persons lay great stress on the economic and social benefits . . . thus confuse the argument for manual training in the schools. . . . The argument for manual training in the common schools is psychological and educational. It is not economic or utilitarian."⁴⁶

Refraction of Pressure Resulting from Influence of Schools

In consideration of the fact that various forces were back of this movement which represented fundamentally different ideas, interest attaches to the refraction which occurred in the work after it came into the control of the school group. The following quotation from Professor W. S. Chaplin, who was intimately associated with the manual training movement in Cambridge, Massachusetts, reveals this difference in conception: "The school in Cambridge started under certain disadvantages. . . . The fact was the people did not understand what the manual training school was. They had an idea that it was to be a trade school, and I am not sure but some of the managing committee thought it was too. But the school has passed out of that condition, and it is a manual training school not aiming to make tradesmen, but to educate through manual training."⁴⁶

Thus it is seen that the intellectual idea dominated in the school when it passed into the hands of the schoolmaster. Another significant illustration of this refraction is in connection with the New York Industrial Education Association, which was clearly modified through the influence of the educator. Concerning this change, Dr. Nicholas Murray Butler, the President of the Association, said in his report to the Board of Trustees under date of May 4, 1888: "It is interesting to note that an organization founded as a philanthropic enterprise has become a great educational force, and has changed its platform of humanitarianism for one of purely educational reform and advancement."⁴⁷

⁴⁶ Educational Leaflets, No. 1, Nov., 1887, Industrial Education Association, New York.

⁴⁷ Conference on Manual Training, edited by I. C. Barrows, Boston, 1891, 101.

⁴⁸ Quoted in Arts and Industry, Part II, 300.

The evidence thus points to the conclusion that the pressure generated by economic and humanitarian forces was clearly modified to conform to the intellectual ideals of the schoolroom. The economic forces worked from the higher schools downward; the humanitarian forces worked from the lower schools upward; the educational forces provided a background for a favorable reception for the whole range of school life but demanded that the end set up should be in conformity with the traditions of the schoolroom. The fact that these forces were bound up in this movement gave the subject a three-fold hearing. It was possible to make an appeal on the basis of an economic, humanitarian, or educational sanction. As a result the spread of the subject has been very rapid since 1889-1890.⁴⁸

Administration

Special teachers or supervisors have been almost exclusively in charge of this work in the various city systems. In the high school these teachers have borne the same relation to the schools as that of any departmental teacher. In the elementary grades the custom has been to set off a stated number of periods per month for this work. Special instructors have either worked in a "central" shop, or have gone from building to building to give this instruction.⁴⁹ Thus the regular teacher has not been required to assume the responsibility for instruction in this subject, except in rare cases.

Summary

With the change in social and economic conditions industrial forces became interested in improving the productivity of the artisan.

The industrial art drawing which had already received consideration seemed to lead logically to work in manual training.

The Centennial Exhibition served to direct attention to foreign skill and the educational means used in its development.

Technical education which was directed by economic forces extended downward into the high schools. The humanitarian

⁴⁸ See Commissioner of Education Report, 1889 *et seq.*

⁴⁹ See Chapter XI.

forces directed their attention to education in the lower schools in favor of a more practical type of instruction.

Outside organizations, largely humanitarian in nature, sprang up in New York, Boston, New Jersey, and elsewhere, bringing such pressure to bear on the public schools in favor of manual training that widespread introduction followed.

The "creative" activity and the philosophy underlying the kindergarten, provided a favorable background for manual training, considered as a purely "educative" means. The prevailing psychological belief and the traditions of the school resulted in the refraction of the movement. There developed a tendency to interpret manual training in the light of intellectual rather than humanitarian or economic values.

The practice of employing special teachers or supervisors of this subject has been almost universally adopted.

CHAPTER V

DOMESTIC SCIENCE

Decline of Home Industries

A study of the pressure back of the introduction of sewing and cooking into the public school curriculum directs attention to the changes in the economic and social life of the nineteenth century. The growth of purely industrial activities and the general rise of manufacturing, brought, as we have seen in an earlier section, a complete revolution in the lives of the working men. Specialization took place to an extent undreamed of in the earlier days of home industry. The division of labor which was made possible with urbanization soon made itself felt in the lives of the women also.

This operated in two ways. On the outside new opportunities were provided that made it possible for a woman to earn a wage at other than domestic work. On the inside the changes in the household economy released thousands of girls from the necessities of home duties. A moment's retrospect covering the work of our grandmothers reveals the great number of household duties that have dropped out entirely in urban centers and have almost disappeared among rural groups. These duties included carding, spinning, weaving for wearing apparel, floor covering, draperies, linens. Preparation of food, in the old days, also involved everlasting labor of the most exacting nature. Modern civilization has worked a tremendous change. Factory products have invaded the home, with clothing, coverings, draperies, prepared food and wonderful time and labor saving devices. With this change there has come the release of girls and women from the home duties. With the rise of ready-made garments home needlework declined. Although women were still in a large measure the ones who worked on these garments, the work was carried on outside the home and was done in connection with power machinery accompanied by

great specialization. Under the new regime raw materials were no longer taken into the home. The finished products were attainable indirectly through purchase, which necessitated money. With this change new economic pressures developed which forced women to transfer their scene of activity and to become wage earners.¹

New Opportunities for Women outside the Home

On the outside a multitude of openings developed which made it possible for a woman to earn the wage. The specialization of the factory provided thousands of places for women. The development of the public school system opened up new avenues of activity which made an especial appeal to the women who were inclined toward scholarly pursuits. Modern trade conditions have provided a vast number of positions for girls and women in shops and offices. Thus economic conditions have brought about conditions that have opened up fields for women covering a wide range of activities. Necessity born of changed social and economic pressures has been met on the outside with such a variety of openings that woman has quickly made herself a permanent part of the wage-earning class.

Early Attempts to Meet This Situation

This readjustment has been accompanied by much distress and many misgivings have been entertained as to the ultimate social effect of the change. The decline in knowledge of the old fashioned domestic virtue of sewing has been more or less seriously resisted for a long time by persons who were interested in social welfare. At a later date this concern included cooking, while to-day it covers the whole field of domestic economy and the household arts.

As evidence of this resistance we find that as early as 1835 the ladies of the Seameen's Aid Society petitioned the School Board of Boston praying that needlework might be taught to the girls in the grammar school. The Board adopted the following resolution in response to the request:

Resolved, That the girls of the second and third classes, who attend the public writing schools of this city, may be instructed

¹Carlton, Education and Industrial Evolution. Dean, The Worker and the State.

by the female instructors of said schools in plain sewing, one hour in the afternoon of every school day.²

This, as well as the earlier recognition which concerned only the primary schools (1821), resulted in little. This is not surprising as the provision was only permissive. The earlier recommendation was hardly that as is seen from the following:

"The Committee particularly recommends that instructors shall employ the girls occasionally (especially those of the first class) in sewing and knitting, so far as the same shall not interfere with their progress and learning."³

"In 1854, renewed interest in the subject was manifested, and a petition, signed by thirty-nine hundred and forty-seven women of Boston, requesting that sewing might be introduced into all grammar schools for girls, was presented. The special committee to whom the subject was referred reported that they believed the usefulness of the schools would be enhanced by the proposed change and that no girl would be considered properly educated who could not sew."⁴

Not only did this spirit of philanthropic or humanitarian endeavor manifest itself in the form of petitions to the school authorities but through private initiative and private support instruction was carried on in many schools. Concerning this, the New Haven Superintendent, S. T. Dutton, said: "I cannot refrain from expressing the high opinion I have formed of the endeavors so long and perseveringly carried on to teach sewing to poor and neglected children in our ungraded schools. The fact that for nearly a quarter of a century philanthropic ladies have been encouraged to carry on the work, asking no aid from the public funds, is to me sufficient proof of its genuineness."⁵

Early Sanction

The arguments back of these efforts were for the most part social and economic. The following perhaps represents the prevailing view. "The arguments adduced in support of the measure were: That the teaching of sewing is greatly neglected in a large number of families in the community, especially among the poorer class; that this ignorance is one cause of the unthrift and ragged shiftlessness of many homes; that it pre-

² Quoted in Barrows, Conference of Manual Training, Boston, 1891, 160.

³ Quoted in *Barnard's Journal*, 1869, 471.

⁴ Barrows, Manual Training Conference, Boston, 1891, 160.

⁵ Report of Schools, New Haven, Connecticut, 1888.

vents many girls who wish to go out to service from obtaining any except the lowest places; that it increases the cost of living to the poor; because they are not able to repair their clothing that the untidiness, which is its consequence, breaks down self-respect.”⁶

The following quotation from Frances Walker also bears upon the social sanction for this work: “We are threatened to-day in the United States with the lowering of the standard of living, and with the impairment of the sense of social decency, which would altogether constitute a greater industrial and political evil than we have known. All the letters that ever were taught in our public schools will not do so much to oppose and counteract the unfortunate liabilities as the two arts of sewing and cooking, properly taught under the authority of the State.”

Relation of Sewing to Industrial Art Drawing

With the rise of the movement for industrial education which culminated in the introduction of industrial art drawing, sewing received much attention. The special committee on industrial schools of the Boston schools treated the subject thus (1870): “Every year more girls are educated for teachers than can find places in the schools. Every year the girls who can never become successful teachers even if they find situations, are instructed in what can be of no essential benefit to them in after-life. They leave the schools and many of them are absolutely unqualified to obtain their living in any employment that requires specific skill. Many of them could not get their support by plain sewing; very many of them could not even mend their own clothes. If in connection with their intellectual training, they had been taught something which had a direct bearing upon practical life, a more useful and happy career would be open to them. . . . Such a training as educates young ladies to be teachers merely and leads them to look upon other occupations as degrading, is surely not the training belonging to us, a sensible free-working community. Labor can be raised in public estimation only by being made a part of the public education.”⁷

⁶ Harrington, Annual Report of Schools, New Bedford, Mass., 1882.

⁷ Report of Boston School Committee, 1870, Industrial Committee.

The committee closed their report with elaborate recommendations in favor of an extension of sewing instruction, which should be made obligatory in all grammar schools for girls.

Private Support in Boston

Owing to the legal difficulties which developed in connection with the employment of special teachers of sewing, these recommendations did not become effective for several years. In the interim Mrs. Augustus Hemenway, a public-spirited citizen, came to the rescue with a contribution of personal funds, thus affording another illustration of the dependence of the school upon the generosity and enthusiasm of private citizens in connection with the extension of the curriculum.⁸ In 1876 the Legislature of Massachusetts enacted a law which authorized the teaching of sewing "in any city or town, and in all the public schools in which the school committee of said city or town deemed it expedient."⁹ With this authority the Board assumed the responsibility for instruction in this subject. The advanced stand of Boston in this connection served as a stimulus for action elsewhere, as was shown by the fact that Boston's example was cited quite generally in the later appeals for public school instruction in this subject. Superintendent MacAlister of Philadelphia referred to it thus in 1884: "But the teaching of sewing is not to be regarded as a mere experiment. Boston furnishes an example where it is carried on upon a large scale, . . . and a report made to the school committee upon the subject contains important testimony as to the value of the study."¹⁰

Relation of Sewing to Manual Training

While it is true that much of the interest in manual training centered around manual work for boys, nevertheless the girls came in for a share of consideration. Indeed some of the manual training enthusiasm for boys was an outgrowth of earlier efforts for girls—a notable example in this connection is the Kitchen Garden movement which, as was stated in an

⁸ Philbrick, Circular of Information, U. S. Bureau of Education, 1885, 91-95.

⁹ *Ibid.*, 94.

¹⁰ First Report of MacAlister, quoted in Art and Industry, Part II, 1178.

earlier chapter, was a progenitor of the New York Industrial Education Association. This movement was started in 1876 by Miss Emily Huntington, a teacher in the Wilson Industrial School for Girls of New York City. Miss Huntington adapted the kindergarten methods and devices to the task of teaching the girls the duties of the home. While sewing did not receive as much attention as did some of the other phases of house-keeping, it came in for its share in the later development of the movement. The Kitchen Garden, which suggested the aim as well as the method, met with a popular response.

Indeed, the movement grew so rapidly that it became necessary to take additional steps to direct it. In January, 1880, the Kitchen Garden Association was formed for the purpose of wider diffusion of knowledge relative to the system, greater uniformity as to the method in the various schools, and to secure its perpetuation. The following statement of purpose is taken from the first annual report of the Association:

"It is the desire of its managers to carry the system into every industrial and public school. The necessity for such an education is becoming more and more apparent, as they become better acquainted with the ways of living among the poor. The teaching of the girl of to-day is not in the direction of household industry. Girls having gone through the public and normal schools look down upon housework as debasing, and almost invariably they seek positions in stores as clerks, saleswomen, cashiers or bookkeepers. This avenue of employment is rapidly becoming overcrowded with applicants. . . . It is to this work of industrial education that the Kitchen Garden Association has addressed itself, and it has adopted, as its method of work, the Kitchen Garden system."¹¹

Especial attention is directed to the sanctions involved in the foregoing statement of purpose. The people back of this movement certainly looked definitely to the restoration of domestic arts, for social and economic reasons. It is strikingly similar to the statement set forth by the Boston School Committee of 1870 quoted above.

The interest continued to grow, but closer contact with the work led the leaders to realize the presence of neglected fields of opportunity. This became so apparent that the Association in 1884 reorganized under a broader plan, the outcome of which

¹¹ *Ibid.*, Part II, 258.

was an organization along the lines of the manual training movement, namely, the New York Industrial Association concerning which a rather full account has already been given. Under the new influence the agitation for sewing took the form of manual training for girls. This was so recognized by the Board of Education in New York City when manual training was recommended for adoption.¹²

Spread of Influence

Concerning the spread of the influence of the Kitchen Garden movement the Secretary, Miss Grace H. Dodge, wrote in 1884: "The system during these years has spread in a remarkable manner, not only in different parts of this country, but also in Europe, and other quarters of the world. There are kitchen gardens in Chicago, Cincinnati, Cleveland, Pittsburgh, Boston, and Yonkers. The second named issues a monthly Kitchen Garden Journal with a good circulation."¹³

These local organizations wielded much pressure on the schools and contributed not a little to the introduction of special instruction for the girls along the lines of the parent association. The following is an account of their activity in Cleveland:

"In the fall of 1884, a few young ladies, possessed of commendable missionary spirit, opened a kitchen garden in one of the basement rooms of Unity Church, about twenty pupils being in attendance. The school grew and prospered beyond expectation, so that early in 1886 it was found necessary, in order to extend the work so as to meet the demands, to organize on a more permanent basis. The 'Cleveland Domestic Training Association' was the result. In February of this year the cooking class was formed and opened at number 479 Superior street, seventy girls being enrolled the first term. By permission of the Board of Education free classes were formed from the pupils of the Rockwell school. More than seventy pupils desired to enter, but less than fifty could be accommodated. In September, 1887, the cooking department of the Association became a regular branch of the Cleveland manual training school."¹⁴

The foregoing is another striking instance of means used in transferring the responsibility of a new subject of instruction

¹² See account of this given in chapter on manual training.

¹³ Fourth Annual Report Kitchen Garden Association, 2.

¹⁴ Quoted from a letter from the Superintendent of Cleveland schools, in Pennsylvania Industrial Commission Report, 1889, 406.

to the general public. The outside group first assume all expense. Later the school authorities give permissive authority for instruction, followed by the complete recognition of the subject. In Philadelphia the Public Education Association was back of the movement which led to the introduction of sewing into the Normal School in 1881 and later (1883) into the Grammar School. This Association which was an offshoot of the Society for Organizing Charity has had a great influence on the schools of that city, and has served as a medium through which the changing social pressures have been transmitted to the school authorities.¹⁵

Private Initiative in Cooking Schools of Boston

The introduction of sewing was quickly followed by agitation in favor of cooking. The influence of private initiative and experiment is here also manifest. The leadership of Boston in this particular was likewise significant. The Boston Cooking Classes were founded and supported by Mrs. Augustus Hemenway, who had already been active in the ultimate introduction of sewing into the schools. The following is an extract from a paper entitled "A Review of two years' work in the public cooking school" prepared by Miss Amy Morris Homans and read before the Industrial Educational Association of Baltimore, in 1887:

"In the summer of 1883, an Industrial Vocation School was opened in the Starr King Schoolhouse for the purpose, not of keeping girls out of the streets, nor of pleasantly entertaining them within doors, but of finding out, if possible, by practical experiments, if there were any sort of manual training important for every girl regardless of her social position, to have, and, finding this out, to ask the privilege of trying this experiment in connection with the Public Schools, with the hope that ultimately it should be made a part of this curriculum, upon the ground that for any instruction of general utility the public money may legitimately be expended. The industrial school was continued during the summers of 1883 and 1884. . . . In September, 1885, a hearing was given to persons interested in industrial training, and at that hearing those interested asked . . . leave to maintain a cooking school which should be attended by one hundred and fifty girls from the South End Grammar Schools, and which should be known as Boston

¹⁵ Harley, History of the Public Education Association of Philadelphia.

School Kitchen, No. 1, as it would be the first Kitchen in any public school house in the United States. The proposition was received with kindly favor and in the School Committee meeting, October 27, 1885, it was voted to permit girls to attend the Boston School Kitchen, No. 1, provided that the parents or guardians of the pupils should so request in writing, the pupils to attend on probation. . . ."¹⁶

The following year another school was started under the name of Boston School Kitchen, No. 2, which was also maintained and managed by the city.¹⁷

Private Initiative in Cooking Schools of Philadelphia

In Philadelphia the same general tactics were pursued. Superintendent MacAlister in his report for 1888 gives full credit for the introduction of cookery, to the Public Education Association. The following account of the early steps is given by Harley:

"At a meeting of the Executive Committee of the Association, February 9, 1885, it was resolved that a committee of three be appointed to confer upon the introduction of cooking into the Normal School. There were a number of conferences on the subject with the committee of the Board of Education, and Mrs. Julia Corson, of New York, was invited to give demonstrations in the teaching of cooking. Great interest was shown in this subject by many of the most prominent people in Philadelphia. On January 8, 1886, Mrs. J. Lippincott opened her residence for a concert by amateurs for the benefit of the Public Education Association Cooking Fund, and a considerable sum was realized. Early in 1887 the Board of Education decided to place cooking in the Normal School to take the place of mythology. Two rooms in the basement were given for the purpose and the Association paid for the plant. The Association also volunteered to contribute fifteen hundred dollars to meet the expenses of the school in cooking for the season of 1887-88. . . ."¹⁸

These illustrations are simply typical of the means used and the agencies back of the introduction of this work for the girls. The same general forces back of the movement in New York, Cleveland, Philadelphia and Boston, were active all over the country. Skillful organizations created such pressure that sew-

¹⁶ *Baltimore Sun*, November 2, 1887.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁸ Harley, *History of Public Education Association of Philadelphia*, 21.

ing and cooking gained a recognition in the curriculum which has proved permanent. Among the institutions that have contributed much to this end should be mentioned the Young Woman's Christian Association, Women's Clubs of the Country, and Home Economics Association.¹⁹

Modification after Fusion with Manual Training Movement

The foregoing quotations also indicate that the school was being continuously subjected to outside pressure which demanded a more practical type of instruction for the girls. Interest was aroused and money contributed in order that the girls from the homes of the lower economic levels might be fitted for better service either as domestic servants or as housekeepers. The work later became identified with the manual training movement and as such was supported by the manual training arguments. With this came a wider diffusion of instruction which reached children of varying social and economic levels. Also under the influence of the manual training idea, the Kitchen Garden Association became the Industrial Education Association. The following account of the extension of the work was given by Mrs. R. D. Rickoff before the National Education Association in 1887:

"In the city of New York there was started a little school called the 'Kitchen Garden' in which the children of the poor were taught housework, and as the work extended there came a cry that these children were being trained for servants, and a company of wise women under the name of the Industrial Education Association of the City of New York took up the question in this way: into the fashionable boarding schools they introduced the subjects of sewing and cooking, taught by the same teachers who taught the poor; and now the question is which one is to be the mistress and which one the maid."²⁰

Attitude of the School toward Domestic Science

Interest attaches to the attitude of the school toward Domestic Science instruction. Superintendent Philbrick expressed the opposition of the teacher toward the introduction of sewing in Boston thus: "It was the force of public opinion and a very

¹⁹ Spec. Report, English Bd. of Ed., XV. Reports of Lake Placid Conference.

²⁰ Proc. N. E. A., 1887, 227-230.

good public opinion too, which caused the introduction of sewing in opposition to the general wishes of the teachers, and for one I frankly confess that I hope public opinion will go much further in this direction."²¹

Many of the leaders of educational thought of the time seemed to catch more of the spirit of the practical demand in this connection than in the case of some of the other special subjects. True they attempted to justify the work on psychological grounds, but the practical side was not lost sight of. This double purpose is brought out in the following quotation from Superintendent MacAlister of the Philadelphia Schools: "I believe that instruction in sewing could prove useful in two ways: first, in providing a means of manual training for girls, that could not fail to supply a want long felt in the schools; and second, by providing an opportunity for acquiring an accomplishment of advantage to every woman in the practical duties of life."²²

Intellectual Value Emphasized

The tendency to justify the work on intellectual grounds was however manifest in the reports and addresses of the day. The following quotations are typical of the expressions of this idea:

"The commercial value of sewing must be small and even its domestic value, except in certain forms, is not what it was thirty years ago; but the habits of attention which it engenders, facilitated by having something tangible to attend to and its peculiar character as a feminine occupation eminently fit it for the manual training for girls."²³

"The moral and economic reasons for the instruction of the hand work have been already presented in a condensed form. Still another may be added that is directly in line of mental education. Every sewing lesson is a positive objective lesson of the most excellent description, because it combines so many points of instruction. It trains the sight to accuracy of observation, and the touch to nicety of manipulation. It calls the perceptive faculties, those of form, place, order, color, into active play and drill. It moreover puts the inventive faculties into profitable activity."²⁴

"But we are not driven to defend the introduction of cooking into the public schools, as an invasion of the proper field of

²¹ Report of School Committee, Boston, 1869.

²² Quoted in Art and Industry, Part II, 1178-1179.

²³ Dawson, in Commissioner of Education Report, 1887, 876.

²⁴ Harrington, Annual Report, New Bedford, Mass., 1882.

education, justified by due necessity. No one can spend an hour in the cooking schools of Boston . . . without being impressed by the very high educative value of the instruction given. The short course, which alone the means at command allowed to be given to each class of girls, has constituted, I do not doubt, the best body of purely educational training which any girl of all those classes ever experienced within the same number of hours."²⁵

It is thus seen that sewing was subjected to the same intellectual interpretation which was given to the manual training work. The schoolmaster in both instances felt the necessity of justifying the new work on the basis of the traditional mental value of the schoolroom. It is true that in some instances the work was undertaken in the spirit of its origin. As an example of the benevolent point of view the following statement is taken from the report of the committee on sewing in the schools of Worcester, Massachusetts, in 1879:

"Our domestics are most frequently useless for plain sewing and mending; and even the parish sewing circle of the present shows a lamentable lack in this essential art. If brought into school practice as a part of a regular discipline, sewing carries its civilizing influence directly home; . . . again the sewing hours should bring a cheerful rest, not of idleness, but of change: a glad sense of business should abound. The souls of children are in sunshine when their hands are understandingly employed. A little colored boy in Dix Street School stitching and hemming a coarse brown night cap for his dear old Grandma brightened a whole room."²⁶

Such a picture needs no comment.

Sewing and Cooking Less Refracted by Schoolroom Traditions than Manual Training

Thus we reach the conclusion that sewing and cooking owe their place in the school in a large measure to the benevolent interest which was aroused by the change in the social and economic condition of the people. This work has been subject to a certain refraction within the schoolroom owing to the conflict with the intellectual purpose and traditions of the school. This refraction has been less, however, than in the case of manual training, because of the possibility of a wider application

²⁵ Walker, Proc. N. E. A., 1887, 196-205.

²⁶ Report of Massachusetts Board of Education, 1879, Appendix E.

of the subject taught. Sewing and cooking have been so intimately associated with the lives of women that popular sanction favors a practical skill in these arts. Such is not the case with any one of the lines of manual training for boys.²⁷

Administration

The prevailing means of securing and directing instruction in domestic science has been the employment of special teachers or supervisors, who have taken in the main the entire responsibility of this work.²⁸

Summary

The changing economic and social conditions of the last century were paralleled by a decline in the industries of the home. As the significance of these changes became more apparent, the humanitarian interests of the period united in the attempt to correct certain tendencies. This very early took the form of a demand for formal instruction for girls in certain household arts.

Through skillful organization and agitation, pressure was brought to bear upon the schools which resulted in the widespread introduction of sewing and cooking.

The traditions of the school were such that the intellectual value received especial emphasis, although the practical ends involved were so imminent that the refraction in these subjects was made less than in the case of manual training.

²⁷ Ravenhill, Spec. Rept. Eng. Bd. of Ed., XV, 19-20.

²⁸ See Chapter XI.

CHAPTER VI

PHYSICAL EDUCATION

Early Attitude

Popular interest in physical education is of comparatively recent date, although there has been more or less agitation in this connection from the very beginning of educational history. This early interest centered around the idea of getting exercise by means of work, although certain recognition was given to free exercise. The following quotation from Benjamin Franklin suggests a type of physical work which sounds quite like that recommended to-day: "That the boarding scholars diet together, plainly, temperately and frugally; that to keep them in health, and to strengthen and to render active their bodies, they be frequently exercised in running, leaping, wrestling and swimming."¹

Although Franklin was intimately associated with the educational affairs of the time, there is little evidence to be found to indicate that any practical step was taken to carry out these proposals.

Exercise through Work

In 1790, Noah Webster in his address to young gentlemen gave expression to this sentiment: "Where it is not the lot of a young person to labor in agriculture or mechanic arts some laborious amusement should constantly and daily be pursued as a substitute."²

In the same year Dr. Benjamin Rush of Philadelphia in "An Essay on Amusements and Punishments proper for Boys," called attention to the desirability of having the youth take exercise in the form of *work* which would fit into their future lives. "In the Methodist College in Maryland a large lot is

¹ Proposals relating to the Education of Youth in Pennsylvania. Benjamin Franklin in Smyth, *Life and Writings of Benjamin Franklin*, II, 390.

² Quoted by Hartwell, in a paper read before Amer. Assn. for Advancement of Physical Ed., 1892. Page 23 of Proc. of A. A. A. P. E., 1902.

divided among the scholars and premiums are adjudged to those who raise the most vegetables." . . . "The Methodists have banished every species of play from their college."³

It is to be expected that in a time when there was so much physical work to do, little attention would be given to exercise that was either artificially stimulated or in which the spirit of play dominated. It is also to be borne in mind that there was little opportunity for sedentary life. Agriculture, which was the dominant industry, certainly provided for a full round of physical exercise. The home industries of the time also necessitated a wide range of bodily activities. Nor were the luxuries sufficiently refined to enable one to get through the day without putting forth a large measure of purely physical exertions.

Under these rigorous conditions it is not surprising to find that the first scattering recognition of a need for exercise should take the form of military exercise or of manual labor in schools.

Jefferson's Military Ideal

In this connection Thomas Jefferson's recommendation in the "Rockfish Gap Commission," which was preliminary to the foundation of the University of Virginia, is of interest. "These exercises (Gymnastics) with ancient nations constituted the principal part of the education of their youth. Their arms and mode of warfare rendered them severe in the extreme; ours on the same correct principle, should be adapted to our arms and warfare; and its manual exercises, military maneuvers, and tactics generally should be the frequent exercise of the students in their hours of recreation. It is at that age of aptness, docility, and emulation of the practices of manhood that such things are soonest learned and longest remembered. The use of tools too, in the manual arts is worthy of encouragement, by facilitating, to such as choose it, an admission in the neighboring workshop."⁴

Although practically nothing came directly from this recommendation it shows the recognition of the need and the argument back of one form of exercise.

³ Rush, *Essays Literary, Moral and Philosophical*: Quoted in Hartwell, *Circular of Information*, U. S. Bureau of Education, No. 5, 1885, 16.

⁴ Quoted in *Circular of Information*, U. S. Bureau of Education, No. 2, 1888, 93.

Military Academies

Captain Alden Partridge who was for a time associated with the military academy at West Point, was an enthusiastic leader in the movement in favor of military drill. In 1820, he gave expression in his lecture on education to the following:

"Another defect in the present system is the entire neglect in all our principal seminaries of physical education. . . . It is from a want of this (a regular and systematic course of exercise for the preservation of health) that so many of our most promising youths lose their health by the time they are prepared to enter in the grand theatre of useful and active life."⁵

As a means of meeting this difficulty Partridge founded the American Literary, Scientific and Military Academy at Norwich, Vermont. In addition to the literary and military features, due recognition was given to the utilitarian side of manual labor. "Another portion of their time should be devoted to practical agricultural pursuits. . . . To the institution should be attached a range of mechanic's shops."⁶

This need of physical education coupled with the fresh recollection of the recent military struggle provided a background for a popular acceptance of military training as a desirable means of making provision for both exigencies. The continued success of the military academy in this country is a testimony of the public approval of such an institution even to the present time.

German Gymnastics

With the advent of the German influence about the close of the first quarter of the last century came renewed attentions to the physical side of education.⁷

Round Hill School which was started at Northampton, Massachusetts in 1825, represented the first fruits of travel in Germany by American educators. The School was patterned after the German.⁸

Mr. Charles Beck, a former pupil of Father Jahn, introduced the German system of free gymnastics. As a result of the political difficulties in the Fatherland a number of highly educated

⁵ Quoted in *Barnard's American Journal of Education*, vol. XIII, 58.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 61.

⁷ *Ibid.*, vol. XV, 233-234; vol. XXV, CXV.

⁸ Hinsdale, *Commissioner of Education Report*, 1897-1898, vol. I.

German Turners came to this country within the next year or two, and contributed much to the popular interest in this form of exercise. One of these men, Dr. Charles Follen, was placed in charge of the newly established gymnasium at Harvard.⁹

In July of the same year a mass meeting of citizens was held in Boston for the purpose of promoting gymnastic exercise, which resulted in the establishment of the Boston Gymnasium. In their statement of purpose we find that they intended to make the gymnasium "a department of public education, under the patronage of the city."¹⁰ German influence prevailed in the leadership of Dr. Follen and later Dr. Leibler. At first the results were satisfying and the influence spread rapidly, but it proved impossible to transplant the German system of gymnastics from the social and political setting from which it sprang. In the Fatherland the whole movement was interwoven with the dreams of the political ideals of the time. Even those who came over to direct the movement after it was shorn of these vitalizing forces soon lost interest.¹¹ By 1830 the wave of interest had spent itself.

Fellenberg Movement

In the meantime interest had increased in another foreign idea, known as the Fellenberg experiment, reference to which has already been made in connection with the chapters on manual training and domestic science. Much faith was manifest in this means of providing a practical sort of physical exercise. This appealed to a more popular sanction than did the gymnastic exercise. Concerning this, the following quotation is suggestive from Thomas Weld, a leader in the cause of manual labor schools (1832): "Gymnastic exercises excite aversion and contempt in the public mind. The people are disgusted and repelled by the grotesque and ludicrous antics of the gymnasium. They say 'leave wooden horses to children and monkey tricks to monkeys.'"¹²

⁹ Boykin, Commissioner of Education Report, 1891-1892, vol. I, 503. Hartwell, Proc. A. A. A. P. E., 1892, 26-28.

¹⁰ Commissioner of Education Report, 1891-1892, 504; also Barnard, *American Journal of Education*, XV, 334.

¹¹ Boykin, *Ibid.*, 502-506. Hartwell, Circular of Information, U. S. Bureau of Education, No. 5, 1885, 21-24.

¹² Quoted in Commissioner of Education Report, 1891-1892, I, 509.

This type of schools made an especially strong appeal to the men in charge of theological schools. The following is a quotation from a set of resolutions adopted at a meeting held in New York, 1831. This meeting had been called to discuss "the subject of introducing manual labor into literary institutions as a system of exercise for students." "It is indispensable that a well regulated system of exercise should be introduced into all places of education, . . . that manual labor ought, as far as possible, to be introduced in literary institutions as a means of promoting health, diminishing the expense of education and cultivating all those qualities in a minister of the Gospel, which the nature of his office requires and the exigencies of the present age most loudly demands."¹³

The movement was very popular for the next decade and scores of institutions were established throughout the country. However, the distinctive features soon disappeared in all except the charity schools.¹⁴ They at last recognized that work had its limitations as a form of exercise for mental workers.

Physiology and Hygiene

Meantime the study of physiology and hygiene was growing in popular interest in this country and in Europe. Although this included more than mere exercise of the body, yet this came in for its full share of attention. This was accompanied by the rise of sporadic systems of exercise which were supposed to have wonderful formative and curative effects. The credulity of the public in this particular was not unlike that which has been manifested in certain quarters within recent years. Some of the "Professors" were no doubt self-deluded; other were quacks pure and simple.

It is interesting to note that there were men who saw the fallacies both in the manual labor and in the pure exercise propaganda even at this early date. In an address before the American Institute of Instruction in 1836, Dr. W. A. Alcott said: "I would, however, lay down one rule which is applicable to all places, cases and circumstances. Exercise to be useful to pupils should be such as will call off the mind from its

¹³ *Ibid.*, 507.

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, 506-510.

common pursuits or studies. It is not sufficient to exercise the muscles; the mind too must be exercised and amused. I would not say that it is of no use to saw wood or to walk to a certain corner, or a certain post every day. I believe that even this is of some service. But it is of little avail, compared with something which would at the same time interest and excite the mind. The pupil should bury, as it were, all his usual employments, in order to get the full benefit of the exercise."¹⁵

Demand for School Exercise

By the middle of the century there came a demand for a system of exercises suited to schoolroom practice. Superintendent Bishop of the Boston Schools in 1852 said: "In addition to the exercises allowed at the time of recesses each half day, all the younger children need provision for some gentle exercise as often as once in every half hour, such as rising, walking, marching, accompanied with such motions of the arms as would tend to give fullness and erection to the chest."¹⁶

In the decade which followed there was a steady rise in the curve of interest in School Gymnastics, which was manifested in recommendations for the school as in the case cited above. Relative to the causes back of this interest, Mr. James C. Boykin, a specialist in the United States Bureau of Education, said: "There is certainly every reason to believe that the influx of intelligent Germans into this country after the political disturbance in Europe in 1848 had much to do with the general interest in physical training that was so plainly apparent in the next five or six years."¹⁷

Dio Lewis as a Leader

Thus conditions were growing more favorable for the advent of a leader who could direct attention to a system of exercise which could be carried on in the schoolroom or in the home with a minimum amount of apparatus. This leader appeared in the form of Diocletian Lewis. Boykin gives the following graphic account of his appearance before the American Institute of Instruction in 1860: "In some way Dr. Lewis attracted

¹⁵ Alcott, W. A., *American Institute of Instruction*, 1836.

¹⁶ Report of the Boston School Committee, 1852.

¹⁷ Commissioner of Education Report, 1891-1892, I, 514.

the attention of the managers of the meeting and was invited to appear before it and 'explain and illustrate his new system.' He did so and such an impression was made at the end of the half hour allotted him, that his time was extended and he occupied two hours of the time of the meeting. The next morning he was accorded two hours more and at noon still another hour."¹⁸

With such an advent into the public mind it is not surprising that enthusiasm for his system grew very rapidly, nor that his methods were widely adopted. In writing on this popular reception of Lewis, Thomas Wentworth Higginson said in 1861: "Until lately all our educational plans have assumed man to be a merely sedentary being. . . . It is something to have got beyond this period where active sports were actually prohibited. I remember when there was but one boat owned by a Cambridge student, and that boat was soon reported to have been suppressed by the faculty, on the plea that there was a college law against students keeping domestic animals and a boat was a domestic animal within the meaning of the statute. . . . It would be unpardonable in this connection not to speak a good word for the favorite hobby of the day—Dr. Lewis and his system of gymnastics. . . . Dr. Winship had done all that was needed in apostleship of severe exercises, and there was wanting some man with a milder hobby, perfectly safe for a lady to drive. The fates provided that man also in Dr. Lewis—so hale and hearty, so profoundly confident in the omnipotence of his methods and the uselessness of all others; with such a ready invention and such an inundation of animal spirits that he could flood any company, no matter how starched or listless, with an unbounded appetite for ball games and bean games."¹⁹

It is hard to tell what the outcome of the popular movement would have been had it not been overshadowed by the military exercises in connection with the Civil War. However, the agitation was to a limited extent reflected in the schools.

Within the next two or three years this system was introduced into a number of school systems of the country, includ-

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, 516.

¹⁹ Circular of Information, U. S. Bureau of Education, No. 5, 1885, 28.

ing Boston, Cincinnati, and St. Louis. It was impossible to keep up interest in this type of exercise amid the strenuous times of war. "The force of the movement soon spent itself and the schemes for physical training assumed a semi-military character."²⁰

Decline of Interest

Within the next few years there seemed to be a steady decline in interest in any form of physical education. The following account of the decline in Cincinnati is fairly typical: "In 1861 gymnastics was introduced as a regular exercise under the direction of instructors specially employed for that purpose. . . . From 1861 to 1865, there was a standing committee on gymnastics, consisting of five members; in 1865, this number was reduced to three; in 1878, the 'committee on gymnastics' was abolished and instead there was substituted the committee on hygiene of five members; in 1881, the committee on hygiene disappeared and its place was taken by the 'committee on boundaries, statistics and hygiene' of three members."²¹

Rise of German Influence

Of the forces which contributed to the renewed interest in physical education in the eighties, perhaps the most significant was the German influence operating through the North American Gymnastic Union.²²

The following quotation from their platform adopted in 1884 suggests their point of view and their means of attaining this end: "It is one of the chief aims of the gymnastic societies, and of the Gymnastic Union, to labor for the introduction of systematic gymnastic training into the existing schools, since such training is indispensable to the thorough education of the young. . . . It is furthermore the duty of these societies to labor in their own sphere, for the establishment and perfection of good German-English schools in which music, singing, drawing, and gymnastics receive full attention. . . . It is obligatory upon the societies to provide for the further education of their members by arranging for instructive addresses, lectures,

²⁰ *Ibid.*, 29. Also *Barnard's American Journal of Education*, vol. IV, 236.

²¹ Boykin, Commissioner of Education Report, 1891, vol. I, 527.

²² Hartwell, *Physical Education*, vol. V, 8.

or discussions, once a month; and such topics chiefly shall be selected for this purpose as relate to the resolutions and principles of the Gymnastic Union."²³

Results of Activity of Turners

It is interesting to compare the plans which were here set forth with those of the New York Industrial Association, the success of which has been noted in an earlier chapter. The similarity in the means employed by these two organizations in their later development is striking. The steps of organization, agitation, free introduction, joint management, followed by complete introduction, which were noted in the case of manual training and domestic science, were typical also in the case of the introduction of physical education under the influence of the Turners. In St. Louis the demand for this work was supported by a petition signed by over fourteen thousand citizens.²⁴

Cincinnati as a Type

The following petition which was submitted to the Board of Education of Cincinnati in 1891 outlines the plan pursued:

GENTLEMEN:

The members of the four Turnverein or Gymnasiums of this city desirous of having the physical well-being of our youth cared for, as well as the intellectual one, wish to impress upon your honorable body the necessity of a rational physical training of the pupils of our Common Schools. In order to give your honorable body an opportunity to personally acquaint yourselves with the various steps taken during a series of systematic exercises, with a view of developing the physical faculties of the rising generation, our three teachers of gymnastics, Messrs. Eckstein, Knoch, and Speidel, offered to teach gymnastics, without any charge whatever for three months, and permission given them to devote at least fifteen minutes daily to each class receiving instruction in gymnastics. It is hopeful, in case of your acceptance of our offer, that the members of your honorable body will witness the exercises as often as possible, and we trust that they will readily see the necessity of the harmonious development of body and mind, and vote for a speedy and permanent introduction of gymnastics in our Common Schools.

Respectfully,

ALFRED HERHOTZ, *Secretary.*

Committee for Introduction of Physical Culture into the Common Schools.²⁵

²³ From Sections 21-23, quoted in Circular of Information, U. S. Bureau of Education, No. 5, 2885, 182.

²⁴ Boykin, Commissioner of Education Report, 1891-1892, I, 525.

²⁵ Shotwell, *Schools of Cincinnati*, 286.

With such appeals backed up by strong organization of influential people it is not surprising to find that these requests were granted.

Other Organizations Contributed

Among the other influences that contributed to the movement at this period should be mentioned, the Young Men's Christian Association, and the Women's Christian Temperance Union. The former association through its gymnasium and training schools and enthusiastic leaders, accomplished much in the way of stimulation of interest in the general cause of physical education.²⁶

The temperance union maintained a department devoted to the interests of physical education and contributed not a little toward the development of a popular sentiment in favor of increased attention toward this phase of education.²⁷

Also the American Association for the Advancement of Physical Education which was organized in 1885,²⁸ contributed very much to the spread of interest. The plan of having state branches of the organization gave it an additional leverage in this particular.

Private Initiative in Boston

As was noted in the case of the other subjects private generosity contributed to the introduction of the subject into the schools. The individual efforts of Mrs. Augustus Hemenway whose activity in connection with the Boston Schools has already been mentioned, was very significant in the East and really did much toward the spread of the Swedish system of gymnastics. In 1888, Mrs. Hemenway provided for a course of instruction under Mr. Nils Posse for twenty-five of the teachers in the Boston Schools. This proved so satisfactory that the following year she broadened the scope of her experiment and entered into an agreement with the School Board whereby she was to provide instruction for one hundred of the city teachers without any expense to the city, on condition that these teachers be allowed the time to present the work in turn in the schools. In the year following, the work was made a part of

²⁶ Gulick, Proc. A. A. A. P. E. 1891, 43-47.

²⁷ Proc. N. E. A., 1901, 760-765.

²⁸ Proc. A. A. A. P. E., 1885, *et seq.*

the regular school curriculum, and a Director of Physical Training employed. In the meantime, Mrs. Hemenway had provided at her own expense a teacher of this system of gymnastics for the Normal School.²⁹

Union of Forces Produced Wave of Enthusiasm

With all these factors at work, the movement by the late eighties was situated almost ideally for the generation of a great wave of enthusiasm. Not only was there an intellectual interest in this subject, supported by a National Organization with state branches, but there was generated a widespread emotional interest through the other organizations. Turning has been close to the German heart for generations. When to this sentiment was added the actual pleasure that was derived in the Turnverein Halls, it is small wonder that they have indeed remained zealots.

The Young Men's Christian Association dominated as it has been by lofty purpose and the enthusiasm of youth, furnished a powerful ally in the emotional awakening. The Women's Christian Temperance Union was likewise rich in feeling.

By the very nature of these organizations they cut crosswise through the social structure, uniting for the purpose groups of otherwise widely divergent interests and passions. Thus it is not surprising to find that physical education was rapidly introduced into the schools from one end of the country to the other. The reports submitted to the United States Commissioner of Education indicate that during the interval from 1889 to 1892 the subject was introduced into over one hundred cities.³⁰

Reception within the School

The question again arises as to the spirit in which this pressure was received in the schoolroom. How did the school respond to this call for increased attention to the health of the child? Although there is no record of hostility toward the movement the traditions of the school were operative in directing attention to the intellectual side of this form of education. This was due not only to the dominant conception of the doctrine of formal discipline itself, and the belief that a few minutes

²⁹ Commissioner of Education Report, 1891-1892, I, 534.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, 582-594.

given over each day to one activity would carry over to remote activities, but to the lack of a clear recognition of the relations which existed between health and muscular exercise.

Physical Exercise in the Place of the Recess Period

In many places physical culture was made to take the place of the recess period for the children. Concerning this plan, Miss Anna Morris, of Des Moines, Iowa, said before the National Education Association: "Believing as we do that outdoor recesses are productive of more evil than good, from harmful associates, violent and irregular exercise, indiscriminate racing and shouting, we have given this phase of the work special attention and would suggest recess recreation instead of recess gymnastics. The windows can be thrown open while the pupils engage in full deep breathing and recreative marching; they can practice on the horizontal bar suspended in the cloak room door. or they can exercise on the vaulting bar. . . . And in relaxing exercises—all of which afford cheerful recreation."³¹

Physical Exercise as a Training of the Will

The Committee of Fifteen of the Department of Superintendence which reported to that body in 1895 on educational values said:

"Systematic physical training has for its object rather will training than recreation, and this must not be forgotten. To go from hard lessons to a series of calisthenic exercises is to go from one kind of will training to another."³²

It is to be noted that the idea of recreation had dropped even farther from the expressed aim of this work, and that the dominant idea was training of the will. A still broader claim for the subject as a developer of the faculties is shown in the following quotation from a paper read before the National Education Association in 1895 by Miss N. D. Kimberland of Detroit: "There are also certain specific benefits traceable to special sections and methods of the work. Among these I would place, first, alertness, precision, and prompt execution of voluntary movements that we obtain through military execution of the

³¹ Proc. N. E. A., 1892, 371.

³² *Ibid.*, 1895, 314.

drills. The exactness and rapidity of this form of movement have a special value in developing concentrated attention, which, becoming a habit, must prove of use in the parallel development of mental life."³³

These are fairly typical of the tendencies in this connection during this period, as judged by the addresses of the teachers. The health and pleasure of the individual child becomes in a way secondary to the formal training of the faculties, chief of which is the will. In 1903 Mr. William O. Krohn of Chicago set forth this ideal thus: "There is nothing so important, nothing so significant, nothing so vital in the whole scheme of education as the development of the proper self-control, self-direction, and co-ordination of muscular activity. Our whole purpose in our work is to make the child's organism intelligent in its every activity. . . . No matter to what school of physical education we belong, our own common purpose and aim is so to fit, so to adjust, so to train the body of the child that it will obey every behest of the will."³⁴

Dr. Harris early recognized this tendency and in his characteristic way called attention to it in an address before the National Education Association in 1891: "It seems to me that it has been one of the great defects in physical education that it has been brought into the schools and made a will training so that the child, who has been exhausting his nervous energy all the morning at his lessons in school, is then called upon to exhaust it even more rapidly in such forms of exercise, instead of relaxing as he ought to. The child must stand up, he must not lean; he must pay attention and imitate precisely motions prescribed. This is a strain on the will power, and calisthenics as practiced in many cases exhausts nervous energy faster than a class exercise in Latin or Greek. . . ."³⁵

Refraction of Demand within the School

From this survey we are led to the conclusion that, as in the case of the other subjects under discussion, physical education came into the schools as a result of outside agitation and organization. This outside demand, which was for a proper recog-

³³ *Ibid.*, 1895, 947.

³⁴ *Ibid.*, 1903, 882.

³⁵ *Ibid.*, 1891, 357.

nition of the physical needs of the child for the sake of health, was refracted by the school, so that the training of the will came to receive the chief emphasis in the minds of many of the leaders. It is interesting to note in this connection the present agitation for school hygiene and free play.

Administration

As in the case of the other subjects the responsibility for this work for the most part was placed in the hands of specialists, though the regular teachers have borne a larger share in this than in the case of some of the other subjects, as manual training and domestic science.²⁶

Summary

The early interest in physical exercise centered around work. This was followed by interest in military drill as a means of providing the proper exercise while at the same time furnishing a form of training valuable for purposes of defense.

Interest in the German system of pure gymnastics which arose about 1825, was soon transferred to the Fellenberg movement. The manual labor feature of this movement struck a popular chord as a "practical" kind of exercise for a student.

The failure of this as a means of providing suitable exercise, and the growing knowledge of the human body through the study of physiology, led to a demand for a form of exercise suited to the schoolroom. The system of Diocletian Lewis which claimed this advantage was rather widely adopted in the early sixties.

This was diverted by the influence of the War which again directed attention to the military drill. With the close of the War interest declined until the early eighties, when through the organized efforts of the German Turners, assisted by certain others, powerful pressure was brought to bear on the schools which resulted in the widespread recognition of the subject in the early nineties.

Within the schoolroom this demand was so interpreted that special attention was directed to formal gymnastics as a means of strengthening the will.

²⁶ See Chapter XI.

CHAPTER VII

PENMANSHIP

Early Religious Sanction for Reading and Writing Schools

The student of educational history in this country is aware of the close connection between the lower schools and the church. Indeed the law of Massachusetts which made provision for these schools, plainly sets forth the religious sanction in the following terms: "It being one chief project of the old deluder, Satan, to keep men from the knowledge of the Scriptures, as in former times by keeping them in an unknown tongue, so in these latter times by persuading from the use of tongues, that so at least the true sense and meaning of the original might be clouded by false glosses of saint seeming deceivers; that learning may not be buried in the grave of our fathers in the church and Commonwealth, the Lord assisting our endeavors. It is therefore ordered that every township in this jurisdiction, after the Lord hath increased them to the number of fifty householders, shall then forthwith appoint one within their town to teach all such children as resort to him, to write and to read."¹

This was copied in its entirety in the Connecticut Code of 1650,² and represents the typical point of view concerning elementary instruction during the early period.

Writing Less Important than Reading

However, it seems apparent that of these two subjects in the curriculum reading was considered the more important. This is not surprising in view of the larger importance of reading in connection with the interpretation of the Scriptures. In support of this assumption the following extract from the Connecticut Code of 1650 is submitted: "It is therefore ordered

¹ Order of General Court, 1647, quoted in *Barnard's American Journal of Education*, II, 327.

² *Barnard's American Journal of Education*, IV, 661.

by the court and the authority thereof, that the selectmen of every town in the several precincts and quarters where they dwell, shall have a vigilant eye over their brethren and neighbors, to see, first, that none of them shall suffer such barbarism in any of their families, as not to endeavor to teach by themselves or others their children and apprentices so much learning as may enable them perfectly to read the English tongue. . . . Also, that all masters of families. do, once a week, at least, catechise their children and servants, . . . and further that all parents and masters do breed and bring up their children and apprentices in some honest and lawful calling, labor or employment.”³

This was practically unchanged for one hundred and fifty years.⁴

It is significant that in this order no mention is made of instruction in writing. The full text is very explicit in stipulations relative to instruction in reading in the catechism and the selection of an honest trade or calling. It does not seem reasonable to suppose that the reference to writing was omitted by accident. It is more reasonable to conclude that writing as such was not considered of importance in this connection. Another indication of this is found in the testimony of Wm. B. Fowle, who in writing of his own school days in Boston during the latter part of the eighteenth century, said, “As no provision was made in the reading school for any exercise in writing, no such exercise was required there; and the immense advantage from having the teacher able to give instruction in penmanship as well as in orthography and composition was wholly lost. The writer passed through an entire course in the Boston schools, and was never required to write a sentence or word of English.”⁵

Traditional Means of Instruction in Writing

The colonists had the sanction of tradition for depending upon the writing master for instruction in this subject. In England the writing school was quite common during the seven-

³ Connecticut Code of 1650, quoted in *Barnard's American Journal of Education*, XXVIII, 171.

⁴ *Ibid.*, 170.

⁵ *Ibid.*, V, 329.

teenth century. Concerning the reason for this isolation, Brown says: "The various styles of penmanship then in vogue called for some considerable training and attainment of a technical sort on the part of the teacher."⁶

The fact that the appliances used in writing were not always to be found in the regular schoolroom no doubt contributed much to the continual separation of these phases of instruction. By the middle of the seventeenth century the practice suggested in the following quotation was quite common in the English grammar schools. "Though the teaching of children to write a fair hand doth properly belong to writing masters, as professors of that art, yet the care of seeing that all they write in paper books and loose papers by way of exercise be neatly done, doth pertain to every schoolmaster. . . . The usual way of scholars learning to write at the county grammar schools, is to entertain an honest and skillful penman that he may constantly come and continue with about a month or six weeks together every year, in which time commonly everyone may learn to write legibly."⁷

Commercial Sanction

This practice developed ultimately into the plan of having a regular and continuous instruction in writing in connection with the other schooling. This did not come about however until there was a pressure demanding it, which was strong enough to break down the barriers of tradition. This pressure came as a result of the increased interest in commercial activity. In regard to this change Brown says: "The eighteenth century gave more and more countenance to this innovation partly because of the growing influence of the commercial class and partly we may believe because of some increase of hospitality toward studies not distinguished by tradition. The new studies (writing and arithmetic) represented the intrusion of a different view of the function of the school; they smacked of trade. . . . It was not for the perfecting of human character but the training up of men to some sort of efficiency and public usefulness. . . . The enlargement of commercial operations, the growth of American shipping, particularly that engaged in

⁶ Making of Our Middle Schools, 19.

⁷ Hoole, Scholastic Discipline, 1659, quoted in *Barnard's American Journal of Education*, I, 315.

the whaling industry, and the rapid extension of the zone of regular settlements had much to do with the demand for such studies as these."⁸

This sanction was present in the recommendation of Franklin. Washington also gave expression to this in his recommendations of a course of instruction for the orphan and poor children in the Alexandria Academy. In his proposal for endowing this school which was submitted in 1785, he said: "It was my intention to apply the latter (the interest on the principal sum) to the sole purpose of education, and of that sort of education as would be most extensively useful to people of the lower class of citizens, *viz.*, reading, writing and arithmetic, so as to fit them for mechanical purposes."⁹

Double-Headed System of Instruction

With the increased attention to the practical value of writing came more definite provision for instruction in this subject. The public assumed a larger share of the responsibility in this work. In the reorganization of the Boston schools in 1789, at which time the "double-headed system was established,"¹⁰ provision was made for equal emphasis on reading and writing, "so that the same pupils attended a writing school in one building half the day and a reading school in a different building, at a considerable distance, and under a different and independent teacher, the other half. Each reading school had its corresponding writing school. . . . Even when the town built new school houses the upper room was devoted to the reading school and the lower to the writing, the boys and girls alternating as before."¹¹

With this reorganization the regular writing teachers were denied the privilege of maintaining private writing schools on the side. Although this did not prove to be a permanent prohibition it indicated the tenor of the public mind on the subject.¹²

The division of responsibility in this double-headed system was productive of much waste as was indicated in the foregoing

⁸ Making of Our Middle Schools, 134-135.

⁹ Quoted in *Barnard's American Journal of Education*, XXVIII, 313.

¹⁰ Dexter, *History of Education in United States*, 427.

¹¹ Fowle, quoted in *Barnard's American Journal of Education*, V, 328.

¹² *Ibid.*, V, 330.

quotations from Fowle. The teachers looked after their own subject only and after a little were selected on the basis of the narrowest range of ability. Concerning this narrow range of qualification for teachers in Boston, Fowle said: "The first three reading masters were good penmen, . . . but this was not afterwards considered an essential qualification of the reading master, and when forty years afterward a change was proposed in the schools, by which the "double-headed" system was to be reduced to a single head, the reading masters were found as incompetent to teach penmanship as the writing masters had always been to teach anything else."¹³

It is of interest to compare this situation with the present one in regard to the relative inability of the regular teacher to teach the subjects which have been recently introduced into one curriculum, such as music, drawing, and manual training. The question arises as to whether or not the time will come when the regular teacher will be expected to bear the responsibility of instruction in these subjects.

Pressure Brought to Bear on Regular Teachers

With the new emphasis which was placed on the common schools under the Horace Mann regime an increased demand was placed upon the regular teacher to assume the responsibility for instruction in writing as well as in other subjects. The school reports of this period are full of reference to the subject. Apparently no opportunity was neglected to give criticism for poor work or credit for good work in this subject. The following are typical quotations:

"The committee have noticed with much regret that the practice of writing has become quite uncommon undoubtedly on account of the impression with many teachers that it is a branch that can be taught with but little success. . . . That writing is a branch of education unlike most others introduced into our schools, requiring great care and attention in its prosecution to insure success, your committee will not deny, but that it may be taught with a good degree of success in our district school, has in one instance been fully proved to your committee the past season."¹⁴

¹³ *Ibid.*, V, 329.

¹⁴ Report of Peru, Massachusetts, 7th Annual Report of Horace Mann, 195.

"With respect to writing, which in some of the largest schools has not been on an equality of attainment with the others, the committee suggests the propriety of establishing a requisition that a specific time each day be appropriated to this important acquirement. The fear is now entertained that it is now more generally neglected than any of the branches required to be taught in the Public Schools. While other branches now as necessary have received the attention which ought to have been applied here."¹⁵

Again:

"A number of the winter schools have exhibited fine specimens of writing. The committee believe that a due attention to this part of education in Public Schools without materially interfering with other studies may supercede the necessity of these common and expensive schools which are devoted exclusively to writing."¹⁶

"It is a well known fact that many people have acquired their fortune by the use of the pen, even when their literary attainments were decidedly below mediocrity. This is sufficient reason why the art should be taught indisputably."¹⁷

In the last statements the economic appeal is set forth very clearly.

Decline of the Writing Schools

These quotations suggest the means used in placing the burden of writing instruction on the shoulders of the regular teacher.

Meanwhile the simplification and standardization of letter forms and the improved systems of copy books contributed much. Text-book publishers were quick to respond to the situation and vied with each other in producing elaborate guides to the teacher in the form of manuals of instruction. With this came the gradual disappearance of the writing school as an adjunct of the public schools. Relative to this change, Ellsworth, a famous penmanship teacher of the third quarter of the last century said, in 1878: "At this day the ancient race of writing masters is almost extinct, having retreated to the back woods so far that civilization is left to perpetuate the 'Art of Arts' by means more scientific. The schools of the land have absorbed

¹⁵ Report of Pittsfield, Massachusetts, 3d Annual Report of Horace Mann, 318.

¹⁶ Report of Rochester, Massachusetts, 4th Annual Report of Horace Mann, 435.

¹⁷ Report of Luxenburg, Massachusetts, 6th Annual Report of Horace Mann, 87.

the subject and the 'poor overworked teacher' is looked to to impart the dexterity in the use of the pen and dispense the philosophy of an experience perhaps not yet her own."¹⁸

Attitude of School

Thus it is seen that penmanship coming into the curriculum as it did much earlier than the other subjects under discussion has had a much larger time in which to become fused with the fundamentals of the course of study. With the pressure created by changed economic and social conditions, the teacher was forced to take specific account of the writing of the children and ultimately to assume the instruction in this subject as one of the primal duties for which the school was maintained. A moment's consideration of the comparative effect of the inability on the part of a teacher to pass an examination in writing with inability to pass an examination in music or drawing will give an additional measure of the degree of fusion which has taken place in respect to this subject.

The implications have been so clear in regard to the end to be attained, and the means of checking up so numerous that the popular will in the matter has not been deflected as in the case of some of the other subjects.

The fact that the teacher had to read the writing of the child in the course of instruction no doubt has also contributed much to the clear cut emphasis on the practical side of penmanship. At any rate educators have not attempted to interpret instruction in writing on the basis of its intellectual discipline, but they have seriously directed their efforts toward a rational interpretation of the demands of society in this particular.

Administration

Since the early organization of city systems of schools, writing has frequently been placed in charge of a special supervisor. The schools of Cincinnati employed a specialist for penmanship as early as 1841.¹⁹ However, the number of these specialists has always been small compared with the number of specialists in music, drawing and the like,²⁰ and their methods have been

¹⁸ Essentials of Penmanship, 1878, 2.

¹⁹ Shotwell, Schools of Cincinnati, 171.

²⁰ See tables in a later section, Chapter VIII.

such that the teacher has been forced to carry a large share of the responsibility in this connection.

Summary

The early reading and writing schools were established in this country with a religious sanction. With this emphasis writing received less attention than was given to reading and was taught for the most part in private venture writing schools in charge of "writing masters."

With the growth in commercial activity in the latter part of the eighteenth century increased attention was given to penmanship and with this practical commercial sanction came a demand for better public provision for instruction in this subject.

Although there was a response to this demand the instruction was still kept separate in the form of reading schools and writing schools.

The recognition of the waste in this extreme specialization coupled with the continued demand for penmanship instruction, brought such a pressure that the division of labor was broken down and the subject became fused with the other fundamental subjects of the common school curriculum. the burden of instruction falling upon the regular teacher.

Owing to the clear implication involved, the will of the people was not refracted in the schoolroom as was found to be the case in the other subjects.

CHAPTER VIII

DISTRIBUTION OF SPECIALISTS

The Spread of the Practice of Employing Supervisors

In tracing the introduction of special subjects into the public school system, it has been apparent that in practically every case this has been accompanied by an addition to the teaching force in the form of a special teacher or special supervisor.

At the time of the first experimentation this was a practical necessity, on account of the fact that the regular teachers, except in isolated cases, had neither the time, technical skill, nor disposition to undertake the new subjects. In the earlier chapters repeated examples have been given of the neglect of these subjects by the regular teacher when additions were made to the course of study without a corresponding provision for instruction. Hence the employment at public expense of special teachers or supervisors has quite uniformly followed the introduction of these subjects. Moreover this has been in complete accord with the tendency of the time toward the further division of labor in all lines of human activity.

Method of Distribution

It is proposed in this chapter to trace in some detail the spread of the practice of employing specialists in this connection in cities of eight thousand inhabitants and over. In the organization of this material all cities reporting the employment of specialists were tabulated in accordance with their location, the classification of the United States Bureau of Education being used. These cities were again classified according to size, the grouping adopted by the Committee; on Salaries which reported to the National Council of Education in 1905, being used.¹ These groups are: Class I, cities of a population of 1,000,000 or over; Class II, 200,000 to 1,000,000; Class III, 100,-

¹ Report of Committee on Salary, Tenure and Pensions of Teachers.

000 to 200,000; Class IV, 50,000 to 100,000; Class V, 30,000 to 50,000; Class VI, 20,000 to 30,000; Class VII, 15,000 to 20,000; Class VIII, 10,000 to 15,000; Class IX, 8,000 to 10,000.

In doing this it was necessary not only to classify cities with special teaching and supervision, but it was also necessary to so arrange all the cities of the United States for each period studied, in order to gain a relative idea of the prevalence of the practice. In all these classifications the estimated census figures used in the reports of the Commissioner of Education were followed.

Sources of Information

The early reports of the Commissioner of Education show no separate column for specialists; however, they were indicated by footnotes in the lists of regular teachers. The first separate classification for teachers of music, drawing and penmanship was made in 1874-75. This material serves as the basis of this comparative treatment, which is followed by the data for 1884-85 and of 1908. In the recent reports of the Commissioner of Education this material is grouped under general headings, which do not admit the detailed treatment necessary in this study. Consequently a new source of information was essential for the year 1908. This data has been gathered from (1) the Vaile School Directories for 1908, an annual trade list of the school officials of the United States; (2) personal inquiry by means of a return postal card, which supplemented the information found in the Vaile Directory. Inasmuch as many city reports distinguished domestic science and sewing it has seemed wise to treat them separately; hence the following tables include the distribution of specialists in music, drawing, penmanship, manual training, domestic science, sewing, and physical education.

There are certain sources of error in every study of this nature, due to inaccuracies in original reports and to clerical errors in tabulation. However, it is believed that in the case of this investigation these are almost negligible. The data collected by the government are certainly fairly reliable. Although the Vaile Directories are not absolutely accurate, the data were sufficiently reliable to command a ready sale at a stiff figure for commercial purposes. The supplementary questionnaire called

for facts, not opinion or guess work, as can be seen by reference to the copy in the appendix. Definite answers were received from 63 per cent of the one hundred and ninety inquiries which were sent out. On the whole it seems safe to say that the following tables represent a reliable statement of the situation for all practical purposes in regard to the points in question.

TABLE 2. SUMMARY FOR 1885
DISTRIBUTION OF MUSIC, DRAWING AND PENMANSHIP SPECIALISTS

Class	North Atlantic States				South Atlantic States				South Central States				North Central States				Western States				United States as a whole				
	Cities	Mu.	Dr.	Pen.	Cities	Mu.	Dr.	Pen.	Cities	Mu.	Dr.	Pen.	Cities	Mu.	Dr.	Pen.	Cities	Mu.	Dr.	Pen.	Cities	Mu.	Dr.	Pen.	
0	32	3	1	1	2	1	1	1	25	3	1	1	2	2	1	1	62	6	2	4	82	14	11	14	
1	42	0	8	5	3	3	3	3	32	3	3	3	2	2	1	1	82	14	11	4	114	11	4	4	
2	10	11	8	3	2	2	1	1	10	5	3	1	2	2	1	1	44	16	11	6	111	11	4	4	
3	23	10	6	2	4	6	1	2	1	13	4	3	1	1	1	1	47	15	11	6	116	11	4	4	
4	16	10	6	3	4	1	1	1	8	5	3	3	3	1	1	1	36	15	11	7	111	10	4	7	
5	12	8	7	1	3	1	1	1	5	2	3	2	2	3	1	1	21	11	10	4	110	10	4	7	
6	5	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	5	2	3	2	2	2	1	1	12	6	6	3	12	6	6	3	
7	3	3	3	3	2	1	1	1	4	2	3	1	1	1	1	1	10	5	6	1	10	5	6	1	
8	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	1	1	1	2	1	1	1	
Combining irrespective of size of cities																									
154	56	40	16	21	1	2	10	1	3	1	111	30	24	23	11	1	1	316	88	68	43	1	316	88	43
Percentage of cities employing specialists irrespective of size																									
Music	36.36										5.26														
Drawing	25.97										15.78														
Penmanship	10.49										5.26														
Percentage of cities employing specialists irrespective of location																									
Class:	0										6	5	4	3											
Music	0.67										11.70														
Drawing	3.22										23.40														
Penmanship	0.45										12.76														
Percentage of cities employing specialists combined in three groups																									
0, 5 & 4																									
Classes:	0, 8 & 7																								
Music	19.14										39.42														
Drawing	12.81										30.76														
Penmanship	11.75										16.34														

TABLE 2 represents the situation in 1885 and corresponds to TABLE 1 in origin and implication. Out of 316 cities considered, 88 or 27.84 per cent reported the employment of specialists in music; 68 or 21.51 per cent in drawing; 43 or 13.60 per cent in penmanship. Thus, there was little change in the status of special supervision or teaching in the decade following 1875. While the percentage of cities employing specialists was slightly less, the actual number of cities reporting was slightly more than for 1875. The school records indicate that many cities were attempting to provide instruction in these branches without employing a specialist. Distribution for location brings out the same general truths as were noted in TABLE 1, viz., that the practice was largely confined to the North Atlantic and the North Central States. Distribution for size of cities indicates that the employment of specialists in penmanship was in general the same irrespective of the size of the city, a larger proportion of cities with a population of 100,000 or over employing specialists in music and drawing than was the case in the smaller cities.

TABLE 6. SUMMARY FOR 1892
DISTRIBUTION OF SPECIALISTS IN PHYSICAL EDUCATION

	<i>North Atlantic States</i>		<i>South Atlantic States</i>		<i>South Central States</i>		<i>North Central States</i>		<i>Western States</i>		<i>United States as a whole</i>	
Class	Cities	Ph. Ed.	Cities	Ph. Ed.	Cities	Ph. Ed.	Cities	Ph. Ed.	Cities	Ph. Ed.	Cities	Ph. Ed.
9	40	1	2	1	8		46	6	6	2	102	10
8	57	3	9	1	11		49	5	5	2	131	11
7	26	4	5	1	4	1	26	2	5	1	66	8
6	29	2	4		5		25	2	2		65	5
5	22	6	2		10		20	7	4	2	58	15
4	18	4	4		3		8	3	5	4	38	11
3	5	1	1		1		6	4	1	1	14	6
2	6	2	2	1			6	4	1	1	15	8
1	2						1	1			3	1

Combining irrespective of size of cities

205 23 29 4 42 1 187 34 29 13 492 75

Percentage of cities employing specialists irrespective of size

Ph. Ed. 11.21 13.77 2.38 18.18 44.82 15.24

Percentage of cities employing specialists irrespective of location

Class: 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
Ph. Ed. 9.80 8.34 12.12 7.69 25.85 28.94 42.85 53.33 33.33

Percentage of cities employing specialists combined in three groups

Classes: 9, 8 & 7 6, 5 & 4 3, 2 & 1
Ph. Ed. 9.69 19.25 46.87

TABLE 6 represents the situation in 1892 relative to the employment of specialists of physical education and corresponds to the tables for the other subjects. The data is taken from the report of the Commissioner of Education of that year.* Out of 492 cities considered, 75 or 15.24 per cent reported the employment of a specialist in physical education. Attention is directed to the fact that this practice was followed in a larger percentage of cities in the Western and North Central States than in the South or East. Distribution for size of cities indicates that a higher percentage of cities with a population of 100,000 or over employed specialists in physical education than did the smaller cities.

* Commissioner Report, 1891-92, I, 582-89.

TABLE 7. SUMMARY FOR 1908
DISTRIBUTION OF SPECIALISTS IN PHYSICAL EDUCATION

Class	<i>North Atlantic States</i>		<i>South Atlantic States</i>		<i>South Central States</i>		<i>North Central States</i>		<i>Western States</i>		<i>United States as a whole</i>	
	Cities	Ph. Ed.	Cities	Ph. Ed.	Cities	Ph. Ed.	Cities	Ph. Ed.	Cities	Ph. Ed.	Cities	Ph. Ed.
9	43	4	11		14		48	9	16	2	132	15
8	78	9	9		17	1	58	6	11	2	173	18
7	28	3	10	2	4		28	2	5	2	75	9
6	41	15	9		6		41	9	3		100	24
5	30	5	5		10	2	23	6	5	2	73	15
4	24	9	4	2	4		10	7	2	2	44	20
3	10	5	2	1	2	1	7	4	4	2	25	13
2	6	3	2	2	2	1	9	7	1	1	20	14
1	2	1					1	1			3	2

Combining irrespective of size of cities

262 54 52 7 59 5 225 51 47 13 645 130

Percentage of cities employing specialists irrespective of size

Ph. Ed. 20.61 13.26 8.47 22.66 27.65 20.15

Percentage of cities employing specialists irrespective of location

Class: 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
Ph. Ed. 11.36 10.40 12.00 24.00 20.54 45.45 52.00 70.00 66.66

Percentage of cities employing specialists combined in three groups

Classes: 9, 8 & 7 6, 5 & 4 3, 2 & 1
Ph. Ed. 11.05 27.18 60.41

TABLE 7 represents the situation in 1908 relative to the employment of specialists in physical education and corresponds to TABLE 6, in implication. Out of 645 cities, 130 or 20.15 per cent reported the employment of specialists in physical education. These figures compared with the corresponding ones in TABLE 6, indicate that the growth of the practice within the intervening period of sixteen years has been relatively small. Distribution for location indicates less variation in the different sections of the country than existed in 1892. Distribution for size of cities indicates that the practice is still for the most part confined to the large cities.

Summary

TABLE 8. COMBINED SUMMARY—1908

PERCENTAGE OF CITIES REPORTING THE EMPLOYMENT OF SPECIALISTS

Music.....	85.42
Drawing.....	75.81
Penmanship.....	21.39
Manual Training.....	43.40
Sewing.....	18.60
Domestic Science.....	30.07
Physical Education.....	20.15

In recent years there has been a striking increase in the number of cities employing specialists. This has been especially true of music, drawing and manual training. Distribution for the location of the cities brings out the fact that the early development of the practice of employing specialists has been largely confined to the states of the North Atlantic and the North Central divisions. Distribution for size of cities indicates that the practice has for the most part started in the larger cities, extending to the smaller cities later.

CHAPTER IX

SALARIES

The information in regard to the salaries paid to the specialists throughout the country has been secured from two sources: (1) The Vaile School Directories for 1908;¹ (2) personal inquiry by means of a return postal, which supplemented the information found in the directory.²

From these two sources definite information was secured relative to the salaries paid in 1908 to specialists in music in 492 cities; drawing in 420 cities; penmanship in 119 cities; manual training in 263 cities; sewing in 67 cities; domestic science in 171 cities; and physical education in 115 cities.

The response to the publishers of the directory and to the personal inquiry which supplemented this was direct from the offices of the school superintendents throughout the country. Consequently it seems reasonable to suppose that the information is reliable.

Method of Tabulation

The salaries for each subject were distributed as to location for each sex, the classification of the United States Bureau of Education being used. For purposes of tabulation and comparison the salaries were arranged so as to show a difference in \$50 units only. For example, salaries of \$720, \$725, \$730, \$740 were grouped together under the single head: "salary of \$700 to \$749."

Provision is made in these tables for a regular scale of salaries ranging from \$100 to \$2,500 per annum. Salaries outside of these limits are indicated by the footnotes. For purposes of comparison the median has been chosen as the

¹ An Annual Trade List of School Officials, 1908, A. S. Barnes & Co., N. Y.

² See Appendix I for Specimen Card.

safest single statement of salary. It has seemed advisable to print the whole distribution tables rather than to omit these and submit a more elaborate statement of statistical interpretation.

TABLE 9. SALARIES FOR MUSIC SPECIALISTS

ANNUAL SALARY	MEN						WOMEN						MEN AND WOMEN Total
	North Atlantic Division	South Atlantic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Division	Total	North Atlantic Division	South Atlantic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Division	Total	
\$100-149									1			1	1
150-199													
200	1					1	1					1	2
250													
300							2					2	2
350	1					1	2					2	3
400	2					2	1					2	4
450	2			1		3	4	1	1	3		10	13
500	3			1		4	15		3	7		25	29
550	1			1		2	4	1	2	10		17	19
600	3			4	1	8	14	5	1	11		31	39
650				4		4	11	2	4	17	1	35	39
700	6			1		7	8	1	1	19		31	38
750	4			3		7	13			10		24	31
800	7		1	7	2	17	12	1	5	7	2	27	44
850	2	1		1		4	4			7	1	12	16
900	8		1	8	1	18	6	1		13	2	22	40
950	2		1	2	1	6	1		1	4	1	7	13
1,000	14		2	8		24	5	1		9	3	18	42
1,050	2					2			1		2	3	5
1,100	2		1	1		4	2			1	2	5	9
1,150	1			1		2	2					2	4
1,200	6	1		3	1	11	4	2	2	5	3	16	27
1,250	3					3							3
1,300	5			1		6				2	2	4	10
1,350	1				1	2	1					1	3
1,400	6	1		2		9		1			1	2	11
1,450										1		1	1
1,500	5		1	1		7	1			2	2	5	12
1,550													
1,600	2	1		1		4	1					1	5
1,650										1		1	1
1,700	2			1		3	1			1		2	5
1,750													
1,800	3			1		4					1	1	5
1,850													
1,900	2					2					1	1	3
1,950													
2,000	3				1	4							4
2,050					1	1							1
2,100	1					1							1
2,150													
2,200													
2,250													
2,300													
2,350													
2,400-2,449	1					1							1
2,450-2,499													
*2,500-2,549	1			2		3							3
	Median Salary, \$1,009.37						Median Salary, \$748.38						Median \$827.84

* Three men received salaries of \$3,600, \$4,000, \$4,500.

TABLE 10. SALARIES FOR DRAWING SPECIALISTS. 1908

ANNUAL SALARY	MEN						WOMEN						MEN AND WOMEN Total
	North Atlantic Division	South Atlantic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Division	Total	North Atlantic Division	South Atlantic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Division	Total	
\$100-149													
150-199													
200							1					1	1
250													
300	1					1	2					2	3
350							2					3	3
400							1	1		1		3	3
450				1	1	2	1	1	3	6	11	13	13
500				1		1	0	2	2	7	20	21	21
550				1		1	7	1	2	7	17	18	18
600				1		1	10	1	2	9	2	20	20
650							11	1	7	11	1	30	30
700							20	1	13	2	39	30	30
750	2					2	9	1	1	0	19	21	21
800	3			2		5	11	1	1	14	3	30	35
850				1		1	6			13	1	20	21
900	1					1	13		4	14	3	34	35
950		1		1		2	2			1	7	9	9
1,000	5	1	1	3	1	11	13		6	4	21	34	34
1,050	1					2	2		2	6		8	8
1,100	2			1		3	8		2	3	15	18	18
1,150													
1,200	2	1		1		4	9	3	4	4	20	24	24
1,250							1		1	2	2	5	7
1,300	1			1		2	1	1		2	1	5	7
1,350													
1,400	3					3		1		2	1	3	6
1,450					1	1			1	1	1	3	3
1,500	1					1	2	1	1	2	1	7	8
1,550													
1,600	1					1	1		1		2	3	3
1,650													
1,700	1					1	1				1	2	2
1,750													
1,800	1	1	1	1	1	5					1	1	6
1,850													
1,900	1					1					1	1	2
1,950	1					1						1	1
2,000	3					3			1		1	4	4
2,050													
2,100													
2,150													
2,200	1					1							1
2,250													
2,300													
2,350													
2,400													
2,450-2,499													
*2,500-2,549	2				1	3				3		3	6
Median Salary, \$1,116.66							Median Salary, \$807.50						Median, \$839.14

* Three men received salaries of \$3,600, \$4,000, \$4,500.

TABLE 11 SALARIES FOR PENMANSHIP SPECIALISTS. 1908

ANNUAL SALARY	MEN						WOMEN						MEN AND WOMEN
	North Atlan- tic Division	South Atlan- tic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Divi- sion	Total	North Atlan- tic Division	South Atlan- tic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Divi- sion	Total	Total
\$100-149	1					1	1					1	2
150-199	2					2							2
200		1				1							1
250													
300	2					2							2
350													
400	1					1							1
450	1					1							1
500													
550													
600				1	1	2	1			2		3	3
650	2		1	1		3	4			1		5	7
700	1					1	1			3		4	6
750	1					1	2		1	2	1	6	9
800	1					1	1			2		3	7
850				4		4	2			2		6	10
900	1			4		5	2					7	11
950	1			2		3	2		1	1		4	8
1,000	2	1	1	1	1	6	1			2	1	4	10
1,050	3		1	1	1	6					1	2	7
1,100													
1,150													
1,200	4	1	1	2		8	1			1		2	10
1,250				2		2							2
1,300	2				1	3							3
1,350	1					1							1
1,400	2			1	1	4							4
1,450	1					1							1
1,500	3		2			5			1		1	2	6
1,550													
1,600	1			1		2							2
1,650													
1,700					1	1							1
1,750													
1,800				1		1							1
1,850													
1,900	1					1							1
1,950													
2,000	1					1							1
2,050													
2,100													
2,150													
2,200				1		1							1
2,250													
2,300													
2,350													
2,400-2,450													
2,500-2,499													
	<i>Median Salary, \$1,104.16</i>						<i>Median Salary, \$766.66</i>						<i>Median, \$920.83</i>

TABLE 12. SALARIES FOR MANUAL TRAINING SPECIALISTS. 1906

ANNUAL SALARY	MEN						WOMEN						MEN AND WOMEN Total
	North Atlantic Division	South Atlantic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Division	Total	North Atlantic Division	South Atlantic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Division	Total	
\$100-149	1					1							1
150-199													
200													
250													
300													
350		1				1							1
400													
450													
500													
550				4		4	1			3		2	2
600		2	1			3	1			1		4	8
650	1			3		4	2			1		3	6
700				6		6	3			4		7	11
750	1	1		1	1	4	1			1		5	11
800	4			10	1	15	5	1		1		6	10
850	1			3	1	5	1		1			3	8
900	4	2	1	9		16	1	1			1	3	17
950		1		4		5	1				1	2	7
1,000	6	2	4	12	3	27	4			2		6	33
1,050	1			1		2	2					2	4
1,100	4	2	2	2	1	11							11
1,150	1					1							1
1,200	5	2	3	6	2	18	1			2		3	21
1,250	1			1	1	3							3
1,300	6		1	1		8				1		1	9
1,350					1	1							1
1,400	6			5	2	13				1		1	14
1,450				1		1							1
1,500	7	1		2	3	13				1		1	14
1,550					1	1							1
1,600	3		2	5		10							10
1,650			1	4	1	6							6
1,700	3			1		4							4
1,750	1					1							1
1,800				3	1	4							4
1,850													
1,900	2				1	3							3
1,950													
2,000	2			4	1	7							7
2,050													
2,100	1			1	1	3							3
2,150													
2,200													
2,250													
2,300		1				1							1
2,350													
2,400-2,449					1	1							1
2,449-2,500													
*2,500-2,549	1			1		2							2
Median Salary, \$1,138.63							Median Salary, \$795.83						Median, \$1,039.39

* Five men received salaries of \$2,600, \$3,000, \$3,500, \$4,000 and \$4,500.

TABLE 13. SALARIES FOR DOMESTIC SCIENCE AND SEWING SPECIALISTS. 1908

ANNUAL SALARY	DOMESTIC SCIENCE						SEWING					
	North Atlantic Division	South Atlantic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Division	Total	North Atlantic Division	South Atlantic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Division	Total
\$100-140							1					1
150-199												
200							2					2
250												
300		1				1						
350												
400												
450	2	2	1	1		2				1		1
500	2			3		4	2	1				3
550	1			4		5	3					3
600	7	4	1	5		17	2	1	1			4
650	8			5		13	4			2	1	7
700	7	5	1	10		23	8			2		10
750	3	2	2	7		14			2		2	5
800	5	1		4	2	12	4			1		4
850	1	2	1	6	1	11	1	1				2
900	3	1		8	1	17	4	2	2	1		9
950	2			3	1	6	1					1
1,000	3		2	7	4	16	1			2		3
1,050				1	1	1	1					1
1,100	1		1	1		3						
1,150												
1,200	1		1	2	4	8	1			1	1	3
1,250												
1,300												
1,350				1	1	2						
1,400	2			2	1	5						
1,450												
1,500		1				1	2				1	3
1,550												
1,600												
1,650												
1,700					1	1						
1,750												
1,800												
1,850												
1,900					1	1						
1,950												
2,000												
2,050												
2,100												
2,150												
2,200												
2,250												
2,300												
2,350												
2,400					1	1						
2,450-2,499												
*2,500-2,549	1					1	1					1
Median Salary, \$804.16							Median Salary, \$742.80					

* One woman received a salary of \$4,500.

TABLE 14. SALARIES FOR PHYSICAL EDUCATION SPECIALISTS. 1908

ANNUAL SALARY	MEN						WOMEN						MEN AND WOMEN Total
	North Atlan- tic Division	South Atlan- tic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Divi- sion	Total	North Atlan- tic Division	South Atlan- tic Division	South Central Division	North Central Division	Western Divi- sion	Total	
\$110-140							1					1	1
150-200													
200													
250	1			1		2							2
300							1					1	1
350							1					1	1
400							2					2	2
450													
500	2			2		2	1	1		1	1	4	6
550							2					4	4
600							2					4	4
650							2					4	4
700				1		1	3	1		2		6	7
750				1		1	2					2	3
800				1		1	3			2	1	6	7
850					1	1	1	2		2		5	6
900	1			3	1	5	1			2	1	2	7
950							2					2	2
1,000	1		1	4	1	7	5				1	6	13
1,050													
1,100	1			2		3	1					1	4
1,150	1					1							1
1,200			1	1	1	3	3			1		4	7
1,250													
1,300			1	3		4							4
1,350													
1,400	1	1			1	3	1				1	2	5
1,450				1		1							1
1,500	2	1		1	1	5			3			3	8
1,550													
1,600	1			1		2	1					1	3
1,650													
1,700					1	1							1
1,750													
1,800	1			1		2							2
1,850													
1,900													
1,950													
2,000	1					1							1
2,050													
2,100													
2,150													
2,200													
2,250													
2,300													
2,350													
2,400-2,440				1		1							1
2,450-2,499													
*2,500-2,599													
	Median Salary, \$1,141.66						Median Salary, \$808.33						Median, \$032.14

* Two men received salaries of \$3,000, one man \$4,000 and one man \$4,500.

TABLE 15. COMBINED SUMMARY OF MEDIAN ANNUAL SALARIES. 1908

SUBJECT	MEN	WOMEN	MEN AND WOMEN
Music.....	\$1,009.37	\$748.38	\$827.84
Drawing.....	1,116.66	807.50	839.14
Penmanship.....	1,104.16	766.66	920.83
Manual Training.....	1,138.63	795.83	1,039.39
Physical Education.....	1,141.66	803.33	932.14
Domestic Science.....		804.16	
Sewing.....		742.80	

The distribution of salaries in the foregoing tables reveals the fact that male specialists are paid the lowest median salaries in music and the highest in physical education and manual training. Women receive the lowest median salaries in sewing and music and the highest in drawing and domestic science. When the median salaries are considered irrespective of sex, it is found that the salary of the specialist in music is least, while that for manual training is highest. However, there is a striking uniformity of price irrespective of differences in subject for each sex, which indicates that the salary is adjusted on a basis of sex rather than on the basis of the subject.

The most common salary for men and women is found in the \$1,000 to \$1,049 group.

CHAPTER X

SEX SELECTION

The information upon which the following table is based was secured in connection with the information in salaries; consequently it includes data for the same number of specialists. This data were distributed by subject and by location, the classification used by the United States Bureau of Education being used. The gross figures are given in section (a) of Table 15; section (b) is deduced from section (a) and represents the percentage of female specialists in each subject and in each section of the United States.

TABLE 16. SEX SELECTION. 1908

(a). Distribution of men and women, by subjects and location.
(b). Percentage of women specialists, distributed by subjects and location.

	North Atlantic States			South Atlantic States			South Central States			North Central States			Western States			United States as a whole		
	Male	Fem.	Tot.	Male	Fem.	Tot.	Male	Fem.	Tot.	Male	Fem.	Tot.	Male	Fem.	Tot.	Male	Fem.	Tot.
(a)																		
Music.....	105	113	218	4	17	21	7	23	30	55	131	186	9	28	37	180	312	492
Drawing.....	37	149	186	4	13	17	2	27	29	15	136	151	5	32	37	63	357	420
Penmanship....	35	18	53	3	3	7	4	11	15	22	18	40	0	0	0	12	73	85
Manual Training	65	28	93	15	4	19	10	2	12	91	17	108	23	2	25	210	53	263
Sewing.....	41	41	82	5	5	10	5	5	10	11	11	22	5	5	10	67	67	134
Domestic Sci...	50	50	100	10	10	20	14	14	28	60	60	120	19	19	38	171	171	342
Physical Edu...	15	34	49	2	5	7	3	3	6	26	18	44	7	5	12	53	62	115
(b)																		
Music.....	51.83			80.95			76.66			70.43			75.67			63.41		
Drawing.....	80.10			76.47			93.10			90.00			86.48			85.00		
Penmanship....	33.94			10.00			36.33			45.00			50.00			38.65		
Manual Training	30.10			21.05			11.11			15.74			8.00			20.14		
Sewing.....	100.00			100.00			100.00			100.00			100.00			100.00		
Domestic Sci...	100.00			100.00			100.00			100.00			100.00			100.00		
Physical Edu...	69.38			71.42			0.00			40.90			41.66			54.78		

Attention is directed to the fact that eighty-five per cent of the drawing specialists are women compared with sixty-three per cent for music. It is also of interest to note that there are proportionally fewer women in music in the North Atlantic States than elsewhere. Relatively few women are employed as

penmanship specialists. While the number of women engaged in manual training is small yet the percentage for women is larger in this subject than the percentage of men in drawing; in other words drawing is more nearly the exclusive field of women than is manual training of men. This is especially true of the North Atlantic States.

CHAPTER XI

DIVISION OF RESPONSIBILITY

It has seemed desirable to take some steps in order to ascertain within certain limits the division of responsibility between the specialists and the regular teachers. With this in mind the following inquiry was inaugurated.

A return postal card was submitted to a group of specialists in each subject selected at random. This random selection was secured by sending an inquiry to every other specialist in each subject whose city appeared on the classification sheets used in preparing the tables for Chapters VIII, IX, and X. The information card read thus:

Subject supervised..... Annual Salary..... Sex.....
Check (X) the method which most nearly describes yours.
() a. Special subject taught entirely by regular teacher.
() b. New material taught by yourself or assistants at regular intervals,
followed by a drill on the same by the regular teacher.
() c. Special subject entirely under your charge and all lessons given
by yourself or assistants.

Three hundred and forty-three replies were received from the nine hundred and ninety-eight cards sent out. Of this number twenty-five were discarded on account of indefinite response. There remained three hundred and eighteen replies that were clearly answered. These were distributed as follows: eighty-three represented specialists in music; eighty-six in drawing; eighteen in penmanship; twenty-four in physical education; fifty-eight in manual training; thirty-three in domestic science and sixteen in sewing. It is thus seen that the returns were related somewhat closely to the number of specialists in each field.

These answers for each subject were thus distributed for method and size of cities.

TABLE 17. SHOWING DIFFERENCE IN DIVISION OF RESPONSIBILITY. 1910

(1) SIZE OF CITY Plan	MUSIC			DRAWING			PENMANSHIP			PHYSICAL EDUCATION		
	A.	B.	C.	A.	B.	C.	A.	B.	C.	A.	B.	C.
8- 10,000		8	2	1	6	3		1			2	
10- 15,000		17	2	1	19	2		4	1		1	
15- 20,000	1	10	1		6	1		1	1			
20- 30,000	2	7		1	9	1	2	1			1	1
30- 50,000	3	6	2		14			3			2	
50-100,000	2	9		2	6	1		1			3	
100-200,000	2	2		1	1			1			3	1
200-1,000,000	4	1	1	2	5	2		2		2	8	
1,000,000 and over		1			2							

SIZE OF CITY Plan	MANUAL TRAINING			DOMESTIC SCIENCE			SEWING		
	A.	B.	C.	A.	B.	C.	A.	B.	C.
8- 10,000	1		8			4			1
10- 15,000			6			4			
15- 20,000			3			2		1	1
20- 30,000	1	1	4			3			3
30, 50,000	1	3	3		4	4			
50-100,000		2	12			4		2	4
100-200,000		1	4		1	2	1		1
200-1,000,000	1		5			4	1	1	
1,000,000 and over		1	1			1			

(2) COMBINING IRRESPECTIVE OF SIZE OF CITIES					(3). PERCENTAGE OF CITIES FOLLOWING PLAN C	
Plan	A.	B.	C.	Total		Percent
Music.....	14	61	8	83	Music.....	9.6
Drawing.....	8	68	10	86	Drawing.....	11.6
Penmanship.....	2	14	2	18	Penmanship.....	11.11
Physical Education..	2	20	2	24	Physical Education..	8.3
Manual Training...	4	8	46	58	Manual Training....	79.3
Domestic Science...	0	5	28	33	Domestic Science....	84.8
Sewing.....	2	4	10	16	Sewing.....	62.5

Discussion

The meaning of this table becomes clear when read as follows: In cities of 8,000 to 10,000 population, eight specialists in music used plan B, which reads "new material taught by yourself at regular intervals followed by a drill on the same

by the regular teacher." In two cities of this size plan C was followed: "special subject entirely taught under your charge and all lessons given by yourself or assistants." A study of this table reveals the fact that more cities report the use of plan A, "special subject taught entirely by the regular teacher" in the case of music than in any other subject. It is significant that out of fifty cities with a population of less than 30,000 only three report the use of this plan while in eleven of the thirty-three cities with a population above 30,000, plan A most nearly describes the division of responsibility. These figures indicate the degree of fusion which has taken place in regard to music and reveals the fact that the larger cities, which were the first to introduce the subject, were likewise the first to consider the teaching of music a regular duty of the regular teacher. This conclusion is also confirmed by the fact that the majority of cities which reported the use of plan C were small cities. The same general situation exists in the case of drawing. Out of sixty-four cities with a population of less than 50,000 only three follow plan A, while in the twenty-two cities with a population of 50,000 or over, five report the use of this plan. As in the case of music the majority of the cities using plan C have a small population.

Reference to section three of the foregoing table shows in another way the small proportion of the specialists in music and drawing who are assuming the entire responsibility for this instruction. Only nine and six-tenths per cent of the music and eleven and six-tenths per cent of the drawing specialists report the use of this plan—C. While these figures are not conclusive they certainly point to the question in regard to future development. Will the plan of administration which has been developed in the larger cities work down into the smaller cities as well as the addition to the curriculum? Do not these figures indicate that ultimately the regular teacher will bear the responsibility for instruction in music and drawing as well as the so-called regular subjects?

The close relation of writing to the daily work of the school has forced the regular teacher to assume this as one of her own burdens. This is evidenced by the fact that there are so few specialists in penmanship employed. The eighteen replies

received indicate that plan B prevails in this subject. Plan B is also predominant in the case of physical education.

In manual training, domestic science and sewing we find a decided contrast in method. Here plan C is the typical one employed. Section 3 of the table, which shows the percentage of cities following plan C brings out this fact even in more striking contrast than does the simple distribution. The percentage in the case of music, drawing, penmanship, and physical education, ranges from eight and three-tenths to eleven and six-tenths per cent, while for manual training, domestic science, and sewing, the comparative range is from sixty-two and five-tenths to eighty-four and eight-tenths per cent. This clearly points to the isolation of these subjects so far as the regular teacher is concerned.

Summary

Summarizing, the prevailing mode for music, drawing, penmanship, and physical education is a varying plan of joint responsibility. In respect to music and drawing there is a clear tendency toward the special subject being entirely taught by the regular teacher. For manual training, domestic science, and sewing, the mode is clearly that of plan C in which the regular teacher has no share of responsibility.

CHAPTER XII

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

Sanctions

Reference to the introduction to this book reveals the fact that this study was undertaken with the view of securing information on a set of definite topics, the first of which related to the sanctions back of the introduction of the subjects under consideration. It is inevitable that in any widespread movement different people advocate the same thing for different purposes, so that any single statement of sanctions must be considered as typical rather than inclusive. The evidence presented in the early chapters indicates that the following were the typical sanctions for the various subjects. The religious and social sanction was operative in the case of music. The need for an artisan trained in industrial art in order to improve the finished product of the manufactures furnished the sanction for drawing. Manual training came as a result of about the same type of agitation and as far as the general public was concerned, it had an industrial sanction. However, the belief in "creative activity" furnished an additional educational sanction wholly apart from the one mentioned above. Domestic science came into the schools with a statement of practical necessity of teaching the girls how to work. This was interpreted from both the economic and social standpoint. The "creative activity" idea was operative to a limited degree as a justification of the work considered as manual training for girls. Concern for bodily welfare was the sanction for the widespread introduction of physical education, while penmanship took its place as a fundamental part of the curriculum under the commercial sanction.

Origin of Demand

The second topic in the introduction was "to ascertain if possible whether the demand for these subjects came from within

the school itself, or whether it came from the social group outside." We have seen that the pressure which brought about the introduction of music was generated by the organization of public sentiment by people outside the school. The rapid introduction of drawing was traced to the influence of the public opinion directed by the manufacturers of Massachusetts and elsewhere. Economic and humanitarian forces united in consciously creating a pressure which resulted in the introduction of manual training and domestic science. The sudden rise in interest in physical education in the early nineties was traced to the organized activities of the German Turners, the Christian Association and private munificence. While penmanship had a special value within the schoolroom, it did not take its place as a *sine qua non* until pressure was brought to bear from outside agitation.

All of this is a striking commentary on the character of the school as a public institution and on its responsiveness to public opinion and certainly points clearly to the conclusion that these modifications in the curriculum have largely come from without rather than from within the school group. The administrator who aspires to genuine leadership in school affairs surely cannot afford to neglect the conscious organization of public sentiment as one of his most powerful means of attainment of ends. The school is being constantly subjected to outside pressure and the superintendent must either yield to these forces or direct them. It is true that the factor of imitation has been operative in the later introduction so that in many cases the desire to be "abreast of the times" has brought about the introduction of new subject matter irrespective of the fact that there was neither a public demand for this nor a clear conception of the purpose involved. However, since this refers to the later development, it does not affect the conclusions above.

Typical Ways in Which the New Subject Matter Becomes Part of the Curriculum

Another topic was: "To point out certain typical ways in which new subject matter comes into the curriculum." We have seen the organized efforts of the Boston Academy of Music; the petition of the Massachusetts manufacturers, urging legislation relative to drawing, the New York Industrial Educa-

tion Association spreading the propaganda for manual training and domestic science; the German Turners and others putting forth the claims for physical education. We have likewise noted that in almost every instance the expense of the initial experiment was borne by these organizations. After a further preparation of the public mind and proving the possibility of the venture, the second step was to effect joint control between the advocates of the new movement and the regular school authorities, followed by the complete adoption at public expense. In view of the facts presented in this study it would seem quite possible to introduce almost anything into the schools provided a few influential people became sufficiently interested to furnish the necessary funds for the development of public sentiment. This plan has met with uniform success in the past irrespective of the subject involved or the size of the city.

Refraction within the Schoolroom

The fourth problem was "to determine the effect of the traditions of the school on the interpretation of the subject matter." We have seen the attempt to interpret music on the basis of its training for the general "intellectual faculty" to the detriment of the real spirit of song. Drawing was in like manner subjected to a modification and the industrial phase was supplanted by emphasis on the intellectual and aesthetic values. The manual training was interpreted on the basis of an educational value quite at variance with the industrial purpose of the outside forces that were so aggressive in its behalf. Domestic science came in for a limited share of this "educational" interpretation though the practical value were so imminent that there was less of it than in the case of manual training. Physical education was to a large degree interpreted as "training for the will." The implication in instruction in penmanship has been so clear that there has been little refraction within the schoolroom. All in all we are forced to the conclusion that even though the public may create a pressure sufficiently strong to place a new subject within the curriculum, there is no guarantee that this subject will be interpreted in accordance with the popular demand. The traditions of the school are so powerful that the response to the outside pressures is made in conformity with

existing standards. If the new demand represents a wide variance from the existing standard the refraction is correspondingly wide. The school has been identified with purely intellectual activity for so long a time that any demand outside of this field is extremely liable to be misinterpreted.

Spread of the Practice

Another topic for investigation was: "to determine certain quantitative aspects of the problem including the distribution of specialists for subject, location, salary, sex and division of responsibility." Relative to distribution for subject, it was found that in cities of the United States with 8,000 or more inhabitants in 1908, eighty-five per cent reported the employment of specialists for music; seventy-six per cent for drawing; twenty-one per cent for penmanship; forty-three per cent for manual training; nineteen per cent for sewing; thirty per cent for domestic science; and twenty per cent for physical education. Compared with earlier reports these figures indicate that there has been a remarkable growth in the practice in connection with music, drawing and manual training in recent years. During about the same period penmanship and physical education barely held their own as subjects for "special" treatment.

The practice of employing specialists spread much more quickly in the north than in the south, and in the larger city than in the smaller city. The later tables show the growth in the other sections of the country and in the smaller cities. On the whole this adjustment has come first where the demand was the greatest. The public schools in the North have occupied until recently a much larger field of social responsibility than have the public schools of the South.

The very sanctions back of the introduction of several of these subjects were interwoven with the problems arising in connection with life in the large cities, so it is not surprising to find that the practice of employing specialists spread from the large city to the small city.

Salaries

The study has brought out the fact that the median salary paid to men in each subject was considerably in excess of that

paid to women; for example, the median annual salary for men and women in music was \$1,009.37 and \$748.38 respectively; for drawing, \$1,116.66 for men and \$807.50 for women; for penmanship, \$1,104.16 for men, \$766.66 for women; for manual training, \$1,138.63 for men, and \$795.88 for women; for physical education, \$1,141.66 for men, and \$803.33 for women. The whole distribution indicated that the difference in salary was determined by sex rather than by subject. Music specialists received the lowest salaries both for men and for women with the exception of sewing, which was slightly lower than music, but there were comparatively few specialists in sewing employed. There was no striking difference in the salaries paid in the various parts of the United States.

Sex

The distribution for sex revealed the fact that women have been largely selected for certain subjects, while men predominate in others: for example, eighty-five per cent of the drawing specialists were women while only sixty-three per cent of the music specialists were women. Penmanship selected a surprisingly large percentage of men, while one-fifth of the specialists in manual training were women. Thus there was a larger proportion of female specialists in manual training than male specialists in drawing. The largest percentage of male music specialists was found in the North Atlantic States.

Division of Responsibility

The inquiry in regard to the relative responsibility borne by the regular teacher and the specialist in connection with the subjects considered, brought out rather clearly the typical methods for each. The typical method in music, drawing, penmanship and physical education is "new material taught by specialists at regular intervals followed by drill on the same by the regular teacher." In the larger cities there is a clear tendency to shift this responsibility in the cases of music and drawing so that these special subjects are taught entirely by the regular teacher. The typical method in manual training, domestic science and sewing is "special subjects entirely under the charge of

specialists and all lessons given by specialist." The slight tendency away from this method toward one in which the regular teacher has a share of responsibility is confined almost wholly to the large cities.

APPENDIX I

INFORMATION CARD

TEACHERS COLLEGE, New York, N. Y.

December 1st, 1910.

DEAR SUPERINTENDENT:

I am making a study of the salaries, sexes, and the increase in the number of Supervisors of Special Subjects since 1875. My material, which has been gathered from government reports and various directories, includes almost 500 cities. In checking up, I find that the data from your city, however, are not in satisfactory form. Will you kindly furnish me the facts for 1908 on the attached card?

Very truly,

(RETURN CARD)

City..... State.....

Report for 1908 (cross out subjects *not* especially supervised).

Supervisor of Music.....	Sex.....	Annual Salary \$.....
" " Drawing.....	"	" " \$.....
" " Penmanship.....	"	" " \$.....
" " Physical Culture.....	"	" " \$.....
" " Manual Training.....	"	" " \$.....
" " Domestic Science.....	"	" " \$.....
" " Sewing.....	"	" " \$.....

Answered by..... Date.....

APPENDIX II

TABULATION SHEET

This illustrates the method used in the tabulation of the data for the quantitative treatment in chapters.

STATE, CONNECTICUT

SPECIALISTS

YEAR, 1908

Pop- ulation Class	CITY	MUSIC		DRAWING		PENMANSHIP		PHYSICAL EDUCATION		MANUAL TRAINING		DOMESTIC SCIENCE		SEWING	
		Men	Women	Salary	Men	Women	Salary	Men	Women	Salary	Men	Women	Salary	Men	Women
1*															
2															
3	New Haven.....	x		x		\$1,600									
	Hartford.....	x		x		2,500									
4	Bridgport.....					1,300									
	Waterbury.....	x		x		1,100									
5	New Britain.....	x		x		1,000									
6	Meriden.....	x		x		950									
	New London.....	x		x		900									
	Norwalk.....	x		x		650									
	Norwich.....	x													
7	Stanford.....	x		x		875									
	Danbury.....	x		x		600									
8	Ansonia.....	x		x		750									
	Manchester.....	x		x		500									
	Middletown.....	x		x		300									
	Naugatuck.....	x		x		700									
	Tarrytown.....					1,000									
9	Willimantic.....	x													
	Derby.....	x				550									

* Class I—population of 1,000,000 or over; class II, 500,000 to 1,000,000; class III, 100,000 to 500,000; class IV, 50,000 to 100,000; class V, 30,000 to 50,000; class VI, 20,000 to 30,000; class VII, 15,000 to 20,000; class VIII, 10,000 to 15,000; class IX, 8,000 to 10,000.

APPENDIX III

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Music

- American Music. One volume in series of *American History and History and Encyclopedia of Music*. Irving Squire. Toledo, 1908.
- Boston. Report of the School Committee. 1874.
- CLARK, HANNAH B. Public Schools of Chicago. Thesis for the doctorate, University of Chicago, 1902.
- DEXTER, EDWIN G. History of Education in the United States. New York: Macmillan Company, 1906.
- EATON, JOHN. The Study of Music in the Public Schools. U. S. Bureau of Education, Bulletin No. 1, 1886.
- ELSON, CHARLES LEWIS. National Music of America and Its Sources. Boston: L. C. Page and Co., 1900.
- HOOD, G. History of Music in New England. 1846.
- KANDEL, I. L. Training of Elementary Teachers in Germany. Teachers College Contribution to Education, No. 31, 1910.
- MANCHESTER, ARTHUR L. Music Education in the United States. U. S. Bureau of Education, Bulletin No. 4, 1908.
- PAYNE, BRUCE R. Elementary School Curriculum. Boston: Silver, Burdett & Co., 1905.
- Proceedings of the American Institute of Instruction. 1830.
- Proceedings of National Education Association.
- United States, Reports of the Commissioner of Education.

DRAWING

- AUGSBURY, D. R. Drawing in General Education. *Education*, vol. XVII, 304.
- BARNARD. *American Journal of Education*, vol. II, III, VI, VIII, X, XVII, XXI.
- BARR, FERREE. Art for the Schoolroom. *Education*, vol. XVII, I.
- Boston. Report of School Committee, 1852, 56, 58, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73, 74.
- CLARK, ISAAC EDWARDS. Art and Industrial Education. In BUTLER, Education in the U. S. II, 705-67.
- . Drawing in the Public Schools. U. S. Bureau of Education. 1885.
- . Industrial and Manual Training. U. S. Bureau of Education. 1892.
- Connecticut. *Common School Journal*, vol. I, 1838.
- Council of Supervisors of Manual Arts. Yearbook, 1906.

- CUBBERLEY, E. C. *Some Changing Conceptions of Education*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin and Co., 1908.
- Drawing. *Compilation of Articles on Subject published as a Massachusetts public document*. Boston, 1891.
- Drawing, In Public Schools. U. S. Bureau of Education, Circular of Information, No. 2, 1874.
- Eastern Art Teachers' Association. 1903.
- FRANKLIN, BENJAMIN. *Proposals Relating to Education, in SMITH, Life and Writings of Benjamin Franklin*. II, 386-96. New York: Macmillan Company, 1905.
- HORACE MANN. *Life and Works*. III. Boston: Lee and Shepard, 1891.
- Massachusetts. *Reports of Board of Education, 1860 to 1680*. New Haven. *Report of Public Schools, 1874-75*.
- Proceedings of National Education Association*.
- SCHNEIDER, H. G. *Drawing in New York Public Schools*. *Education*, vol. XVII, 204.
- United States, *Reports of Commissioner of Education*.

MANUAL TRAINING

- BARROWS, ISABEL. *Conference on Manual Training*. Boston, 1891.
- Boston. *Report of School Committee, 1882, 1883, 1884*.
- BROWN, ELMER E. *Making of Our Middle Schools*. New York: Longmans, Green & Co., 1902.
- CARLTON, FRANK TRACY. *Economic Influences on Education*. New York: New York: Macmillan Company, 1908.
- Circular of Information*. No. 2, 1889. U. S. Bureau of Education.
- CLARK, ISAAC EDWARDS. *Art and Industry*. Part I, II, III, and IV. 1885-1889. U. S. Bureau of Education.
- Council of Supervisors of Manual Arts. *Yearbook, 1906*.
- DEXTER, EDWIN G. *History of Education in United States*. New York: Macmillan Company, 1906.
- Eastern Art Teachers' Association, 1903.
- FROEBEL. *Educational Laws*.
- HAM, CHAS. H. *Manual Training*. New York: Harper & Bro., 1886.
- McARTHUR, ARTHUR. *Education in its Relation to Manual Industry*. New York: Appleton & Co., 1884.
- Princeton Review*, 1883.
- Proceedings of Eastern Manual Arts Association, 1905-6*.
- Proceedings of National Education Association*.
- Proceedings of International Congress of Education, 1903*.
- Report, Regents of University of New York*. 102 an. Albany, 188.
- Report, Commission on Industrial Education made to Legislature of Pennsylvania*.
- United States, *Reports of Commissioner of Education*.
- WOODWARD, C. M. *The Manual Training School*. New York: Chas. Scribners' Sons, 1896.

DOMESTIC SCIENCE

- BARNARD. *American Journal of Education*, 1869.
 Boston. Report of School Committee, 1869-1870.
 CARLTON, FRANK TRACY. *Economic Influences on Education*. New York: Macmillan Company, 1908.
 CLARK, ISAAC EDWARDS. *Art and Industry*. Part I, 1885, 1400 pages. U. S. Bureau of Education.
 ———. *Art and Industry*. Part II, 1892, 1338 pages. U. S. Bureau of Education.
 DEAN. *Worker and the State*. New York: Century Co., 1910.
 English Board of Education, Special Report. London, 1905.
 HARLEY. *History of Public Education Association of Philadelphia*. Philadelphia.
 Massachusetts. Report of Board of Education, 1879.
 New Bedford, Massachusetts. Report of Public School, 1879-1887.
 New Haven. Report of Public Schools, 1888.
 PHILBRICK, JOHN. Circular of Information, No. 1, 1885, U. S. Bureau of Education.
 Proceedings, National Education Association, 1887 to present date.
 Report, Commission on Industrial Education made to Legislature Pennsylvania, Harrisburg, 1889.
 Reports of Lake Placid Conference.
 United States Commissioner of Education. U. S. Bureau of Education, 1887.

PHYSICAL EDUCATION

- ALCOTT, W. A. *American Institute of Instruction*, 1830.
American Physical Education Review.
 BARNARD. *American Journal of Education*, vols. XIV, XV, XXV.
 BOYKIN, J. C. *Physical Training*, Report Commissioner of Education. U. S. Bureau of Education, 1891-92, vol. I, pages 451-594.
 GULICK, L. *Proceedings American Association for Advancement of Physical Education*, 189.
 HARTWELL, E. M. Report, Director Physical Training, Boston School Document No. 4, 1895.
 ———. *Physical Training in American Colleges*. U. S. Bureau of Education, Circular of Information, No. 5, 1885.
 ———. *Proc. American Association for Advancement of Physical Education*, 1892.
 HINSDALE, B. A. *Commissioners of Education, Report*, U. S. Bureau of Education.
 McCURDY, J. H. *Physical Training in Public Schools*. *American Physical Education Review*, X.
 Proceedings, International Congress of Education, Chicago, 1903.
 Proceedings, National Educational Association, 1891 to present date.
 SHOTWELL. *Schools of Cincinnati, Cincinnati*.

PENMANSHIP

BARNARD. *American Journal of Education*, vols. II, IV, V, XXVIII.

BROWN, ELMER E. *Making of our Middle Schools*. New York: Longmans, Green & Co., 1906.

ELLSWORTH, H. W. *Essentials of Penmanship*. New York, 1878.

HORACE MANN. *Annual Reports*, III, IV, VI, VII, Boston.

SHOTWELL. *Schools of Cincinnati, Cincinnati*.

STANFORD UNIVERSITY LIBRARY

To avoid fine, this book should be returned on
or before the date last stamped below.

Summer 1922

1922

Reserved

CL 12 1926

370.6 .C7261 v.43 C.1
The social factors affecting s
Stanford University Libraries



3 6105 042 783 071

370.6

C7261

no. 43

BASEMENT



162.708

